# **Periodic External Review Report**

# St Padarn's Institute, Church in Wales

**Conducted onsite, October 2022** 

Published 2023 by the Church in Wales and the Ministry Development Team of the Archbishops' Council of the Church of England Copyright © The Archbishops' Council 2023

Church House, Great Smith Street, London SW1P 3AZ

Switchboard: +44(0)20 7898 1000 Email: ministry@churchofengland.org

Website: www.churchofengland.org

The Archbishops' Council of the Church of England is a registered charity

# **Contents**

GLOSSARY	3
REVIEWERS	4
PERIODIC EXTERNAL REVIEW FRAMEWORK	5
INTRODUCTION	6
FULL REPORT	10
SECTION A: FORMATIONAL AIMS	10
SECTION B: FORMATIONAL CONTEXT	17
SECTION C: LEADERSHIP AND MANAGEMENT	25
SECTION D: TEACHING AND LEARNING	32
SECTION E: MINISTERIAL FORMATION	41
COMMENDATIONS	49
WIDER STRATEGIC RECOMMENDATIONS	51
OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS	52

# **Glossary**

ASE Annual Self Evaluation

AUA Association of University Administrators

BIAPT British and Irish Association for Practical Theology

CMD Continuing Ministerial Development

DDO Diocesan Director of Ordinands

FHEQ Frameworks for Higher Education Qualifications

FLM Formation for Licensed Ministry (IME1)

GDPR General Data Protection Regulation

HEA Higher Education Academy

ILO Intended Learning Outcomes

IME1/2 Initial Ministerial Education Phase 1/2

LLM Licensed Lay Minister

Moodle Online learning platform

NLM New Licensed Ministers' training (IME2)

PER Periodic External Review

PGT/R Postgraduate Taught/Research programme

QAA Quality Assurance Agency

RB Representative Body of the Church in Wales

SWOT Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, Threats

TEI Theological Education Institution

TI Training Incumbent

UG Undergraduate programme

UKBHC UK Board of Healthcare Chaplaincies

UKME / GMH UK Minority Ethnicity / Global Majority Heritage

UWTSD University of Wales Trinity St David

# **Reviewers**

Revd Canon Rebecca Swyer, Senior Reviewer; Director for Apostolic Life, Chichester Diocese

**Revd Dr Admos Chimhowu**, Deputy Associate Dean for Postgraduate Research, Manchester University (Manchester Diocese)

**Revd Dr Ela Nutu Hall**, Member of the Sheffield Centre for Interdisciplinary Biblical Studies and Head of Residence Life, University of Sheffield (Sheffield Diocese)

Revd James Halstead, Principal, School of Discipleship, Southwell & Nottingham Diocese

# **The Periodic External Review Framework**

In commissioning this review of St Padarn's Institute the Church in Wales has opted to take part in the independent and external quality assurance process known as Periodic External Review (PER).

PER is part of the Church of England's quality assurance for its ministerial training institutions ('Theological Education Institutions' or TEIs), whereby the church conducts an external quality check of each TEI against national standards and expectations for ministerial training and formation.

On behalf of the church, review teams are asked to assess the TEI's fitness for purpose in preparing candidates for ordained and licensed ministry and to make recommendations for the enhancement of its life and work. For reviews of Church of England TEIs, the reviewers' report is made to the House of Bishops acting through the Ministry Council. For this review of St Padarn's Institute, reporting is to the Church in Wales via its Bench of Bishops.

Church PER teams are appointed by the national Ministry Development Team from a pool of reviewers nominated by bishops and TEIs.

For TEIs that offer Durham-validated Common Awards programmes, representatives of Durham University's Common Awards team sometimes carry out their own academic quality assurance review in parallel with the church's PER, to inform the university's decision on renewal of the Common Awards partnerships with the TEI and revalidation of its programmes.

This report is written in relation to the PER Criteria in force for 2022-23 and available via the Ministry Development Team's quality assurance pages on the Church of England website. The team of reviewers shaped and adapted the process where appropriate in order that it worked effectively within the Church in Wales, which differs from the Church of England in several distinct ways. Perhaps the most important distinctive feature in relation to undertaking an effective PER is the embedded nature of St. Padarn's with the Bench of Bishops and the Representative Body of the Church in Wales. As a result, the Criteria (particularly Sections A and E) and assessment point in several places to wider strategic issues that are beyond the scope of St. Padarn's oversight and responsibilities. In other areas, responsibility for addressing recommendations must necessarily be shared between St. Padarn's and the Bench or/and others.

## **Recommendations and Commendations**

PER reports include Recommendations which are either developmental, naming issues that the reviewers consider the TEI (or/and others) needs to address, or encourage the enhancement of practice that is already good. They also include Commendations, naming instances of good practice that the reviewers wish to highlight.

# **Review of St Padarn's Institute, Church in Wales**

### Introduction

The Church in Wales is disestablished and has a different legal and cultural standing in Wales to the Anglican Church in England. There are six dioceses in the province: Bangor, Llandaff, Monmouth, St Asaph, St David's, and Swansea and Brecon. Each has its own bishop, one of whom is elected as Archbishop who normally appoints an assistant bishop to support their ministry. Each diocese is distinctive in terms of geography, population, culture and economy.

The 2012 Harries report was a response to the September 2010 meeting of the Governing Body, which noted: 'The Church in Wales cannot go on doing the same things in the same way; some things need to change and we are open to – and indeed encourage – that possibility.' Responding to this, the Standing Committee and Bench of Bishops initiated an external review of the Church: '...with particular reference to its structures and use of resources, to increase the effectiveness of the Church's ministry and witness.'

The report made a number of recommendations, including a radical move towards forming parishes into ministry areas. Alongside this was a clear call for greater collaboration and integrated vision (e.g., Recommendation XV). In order to do this the report said: 'What is needed is a new, more collaborative, style of leadership, modelled by the Bishops and reflected at parish level.'

The Harries report critiqued and made some recommendations about St Michael's College, the main TEI within the province (though the St. Seiriol Centre had also been established in north Wales), noting: 'We believe that all training for ministry in the Church in Wales, whether by clergy or lay people, and whether it is predominantly residential or non-residential, should reflect an integrated vision of training.' However, it raised some fundamental questions about the college, concluding: 'The more radical question is whether the present pattern of training is the right one for the Church in Wales today.'

Ongoing reflection and discussion about the report and its recommendations led ultimately to the closure of St Michael's College and the foundation of the St Padarn's Institute in July 2016. St Padarn's is structured and functions in a very different way within the Church in Wales to TEIs within the Church of England. Whilst making good use of the physical site in Llandaff, Cardiff (previously occupied by St Michael's College) as their administrative base and permanent teaching space, St Padarn's Institute is the 'training arm' of the whole of the Church in Wales and uses venues and engages with people across the province. The expectation is that all lay and ordained ministerial training before and after licensing is overseen by St Padarn's.

St Padarn's is not an independent institution, but all staff are employees of the Representative Body of the Church in Wales, who are trustees of the Institute and have oversight of its budget and the financing of all grants and costs of training. The Principal meets monthly with the Chief Executive of the Representative Body (RB) and the designated Ministry Bishop, currently Bishop Cherry Vann, Bishop of Monmouth. Long term planning and the strategic development of training are seen through the eyes of the Representative Body and the Bench of Bishops, rather than being initiated and led solely by the Principal and staff of St Padarn's.

The first six years of the life of St Padarn's has been a period of rapid development, though this has inevitably been impacted by the Coronavirus pandemic. Some of the recommendations of the Harries report have been enabled in the Church in Wales, others are developing slightly differently in each diocese. There are emerging issues concerning what can be held provincially and what should be decided locally to meet the needs of mission in each diocese.

Recent years have seen a steep decline in church attendance and many chapels have closed. This has refocused the Church in Wales on what it means to be the Anglican Church in Wales and now not uncommonly the only Christian denomination in a community. This has led to the Church in Wales proactively engaging with issues of Welsh culture and language, mirroring the growing confidence in a national cultural identity evident since the creation of the Welsh Assembly as the devolved legislature of Wales in 1998.

The St Padarn's strapline is 'formation in community for mission'. It contributes to the Church primarily in seven different areas: lay discipleship and theological education, formation for lay and ordained licensed ministry (IME 1), ongoing formation for newly licensed ministers (IME 2), continuing ministerial development (CMD), networks to support specialist work across the whole church, specialist Masters programmes, and consultancy of various sorts. In effect, St Padarn's is involved in the formation of lay and ordained ministers (alongside their significant work with lay disciples) from their initial training, right through into CMD. Dioceses – and their bishops and diocesan officers - are also involved in the formation and training process throughout initial and ongoing training. However, the weight of responsibility held by St Padarn's shifts, with dioceses taking more responsibility and oversight during the 'newly-licensed ministry' (NLM) and CMD stages. This review focuses on the FLM and NLM work, but this does not underestimate the important and significant contribution made by St. Padarn's to the Christian formation of the people of God across Wales.

### **PER Process**

The PER process was designed for TEIs within the Church of England and has therefore required some adaptation for St Padarn's because of its different structure and role within the Church in Wales. This review was initiated at the request of the Principal, Jeremy Duff and the Bench of Bishops as a means of seeking an objective view of how St Padarn's is developing.

In October 2022, the team of reviewers representing the Church of England's Ministry Development Team visited a residential for Newly Licensed Ministers (NLMs) in Bangor, a Formation for Licensed Ministry (FLM) residential in Cwmbran and onsite at St Padarn's, Llandaff. Whilst this review covers both FLM and NLM training and the team fully engaged with the NLM paperwork and residential, they did spend a greater amount of time directed to FLM activity. However, this should not be seen as diminishing the importance of NLM training or of the team's appreciation of the value brought by St. Padarn's very significant role in bringing continuity, input and oversight through the different stages of formation and training for all licensed ministry in the Church in Wales (and indeed formation of Christian disciples more widely).

Reviewers were able to observe a range of teaching sessions, both online and in-person, and attend a variety of acts of worship at each venue. We had conversations with key members of staff, Archbishop

Andrew John, Bishop Cherry Vann (the Ministry Bishop), Canon Simon Lloyd (Chief Executive of the Representative Body of the Church in Wales), and a broad range of past and present candidates and stakeholders.

The team of reviewers were warmly welcomed by staff and candidates and found participants in interviews were almost universally measured, open and honest and wanted to see St Padarn's continue to grow into its potential. Practical arrangements were dealt with very efficiently and diligently.

The PER documentation received was clear, thorough, and received in very good time. This material included a bespoke self-evaluation document, module overview tables, curriculum mapping documents, staff and student handbooks, external examiner reports, statistical data, previous validation and inspection reports, and feedback from a range of stakeholders.

In order that the PER is effective, some adjustments have been made within each criterion, to reflect the distinctive nature of St Padarn's. Whilst the focus of this PER is St Padarn's, because of how they are embedded with and relate to the Bench of Bishops, some of the team's recommendations are for St Padarn's alone, others are to be considered collegially with the Bench of Bishops and others. We have also indicated wider strategic recommendations for the Bench of Bishops to consider, highlighting issues beyond the responsibility and oversight of St Padarn's, but which fundamentally impact their work, effectiveness, and strategic direction.

### **General Observations**

The population of Wales is significantly smaller than England, which means the Church in Wales has a more familial identity. As the only TEI in Wales, St Padarn's must seek to engage with the ecclesial breadth and diverse geographical, diocesan and individual needs. The reviewers found a happy, mission-focused, friendly and mutually supportive community of candidates with committed leadership and a readiness to reflect, learn, grow and innovate.

St Padarn's – along with the Bench of Bishops – requested this PER, not wanting to merely be judged by anecdote, but seeking objective assessment. The SWOT analysis demonstrates that they know their strengths, weaknesses and opportunities for growth and areas of threat, something also evident in our conversations with staff.

St Padarn's is clearly a community that has formation at its heart, something indicated by their preferred term 'candidates' rather than 'students', unless discussion is clearly about academic work. The stress on formation is echoed also in their broader work in forming and equipping the laity in their Christian discipleship. The main recommendations for St Padarn's are developmental rather than remedial and not unexpected at this early stage of its development.

Key strategic issues for the Bench of Bishops focus on the need for greater clarity in their vision for lay and ordained ministry to serve the needs of God's mission and workforce planning. This requires the development of a proactive vocations strategy, a renewed national process of discernment and selection and then communicating to St Padarn's exactly what the Bench want and expect in terms of training and formation for lay and ordained licensed ministry.

Whilst the integrated structure of St Padarn's within the Church in Wales brings many benefits, the reviewers also identified some points of tension. What can be decided on a provincial level and what is best agreed locally in each diocese is not always clear. Seeking to shape and agree strategy within the Bench of Bishops is theologically sound but is not easy to do in practice with a small and diverse group of bishops, the majority of whom have changed in the years since the creation of St Padarn's.

There is a growing openness to pioneering and fresh expressions of ministry within the Church in Wales and the RB has released a significant amount of money to enable growth (akin to the Strategic Development Fund in the Church of England), partnering and welcoming new HTB (Holy Trinity Brompton) resource churches in North and South Wales. However, the reviewers did not always have a clear sense of who holds the strategic vision behind this; we noted that the Strategic Direction 2022-2028 document was drafted by the Principal and then discussed and 'warmly received' in February 2022 by the Bench of Bishops but has not yet been formally adopted by the Bench. It is essential for St Padarn's to have a clear agreed vision and strategy to work to in this next phase of its development, building on what has already been achieved.

# **Section A: Formational Aims**

# A1 The TEI's formational aims are clearly stated, understood and owned within the TEI.

- 1. St Padarn's seeks to offer mission-orientated formation and training for the whole people of God.

  The formational aims were not merely shaped by the staff of St Padarn's but developed and honed with the Executive of the Representative Body and the Bench of Bishops.
- 2. The formational aims are clearly stated on the website, whose homepage states in bold letters: 'Formation in community for mission'. The same page includes a welcome from the principal, which clearly identifies St Padarn's as: 'The Church in Wales in theological-education mode'. However, this is not just about gaining theological knowledge and understanding for its own sake but has a clear focus on mission: 'We believe that when the church looks inwards, it gets caught up in controversies and arguments. We find the right perspective when we focus on God's mission in his world.'
- 3. The formational aims of the Institute are very clear on the homepage of their website: "Outstanding" is a daunting word. We use it not because we have arrived but to remind ourselves that the challenge faced by the Church in our generation is big, and the needs in our communities are great. God does not call us to be mediocre or "lukewarm". The reviewers found an infectious confidence in the gospel and zeal for mission amongst staff and candidates alike.
- 4. As a new institution, St Padarn's was deliberate in establishing what they mean by formation and so the logic of their training programmes and how these contribute to the sort of formation which the Church in Wales has said it needs. We were provided with two documents, which examine the formational vision in detail: 'Formational excellence in this Generation' a paper written by the Principal, received by the bishops and shared with the staff to explicate the origins and identity of St Padarn's; and 'Virtual Formation', which was a recent paper given by the Dean for Initial Ministerial Training at a BIAPT conference, exploring how St Padarn's has further developed its understanding of formation during the pandemic.
- 5. A succinct summary of the vision would be a clear focus on 'integrated formation'. Integration is stated, understood and owned in diverse and complex ways, which include those on lay and ordained pathways training together; the incorporation of residential and non-residential/contextual elements of training; full and part time candidates sometimes being brought together and sometimes separated into pathways; integration in modules of different theological disciplines. All ministerial candidates are involved in the same four strands: academic learning, placements, formational cells and residentials. This sense of integrated formation is very evident in the programme handbooks and throughout the documentation the team were provided with.
- 6. The Church in Wales recently adopted a new set of Formative Expectations for Licensed Ministry (lay and ordained), following the articulation of ministry priorities by the Ministry Bishop. The headings are: Confidence, Security and Mature Faith; Team Working; Creative, Flexible and Adaptable; Grounded in Anglican Ecclesiology and Spirituality; Missional and Committed to Growth; and Strategic Leaders and Guides. St Padarn's demonstrated its ability to be agile and

- own these aims by immediately re-shaping FLM residentials (two of the team were present during a residential focusing on the first criteria) and ensuring reporting and formational records align with the new headings.
- 7. We did perceive some lack of confidence in their ministry from some of those at the NLM stages, something observed also by those in diocesan roles. Our interviews with bishops and others in senior roles within the Church in Wales suggest that there is sometimes a communication gap between what St Padarn's are trying to do and the reality and culture of the wider Church in Wales and the distinct identity of each of its dioceses.

## Wider Strategic Recommendation 1

That the Director of Ministry Development, Bench of Bishops and appropriate others undertake further work on effective communication with St Padarn's, ensuring their work is firmly embedded and understood within the wider vision of the Church in Wales and its individual dioceses.

- A2 The TEI's formational aims are appropriate to the ministerial training requirements of its sponsoring church denominations.
- 8. The Harries Report identified the essential need for collaborative ministry alongside a capacity to work across different contexts and ministry areas.
- 9. St Padarn's has a strong sense of collaboration. It was evident to the reviewers that there is one community, made up of staff and candidates who are broadly happy, mutually supportive and enthusiastic about formation and training. All candidates undertake training in pioneering and are encouraged to have a creative approach to mission and ministry.
- 10. The Principal models clear leadership, whilst being highly collaborative, responsive and focused on the needs of God's mission. There is a notable lack of obvious hierarchy, in the sense that lay and ordained members of the community are treated the same and, as and where possible, the division of support staff and teaching/tutorial staff is avoided.
- 11. There is an expectation that other senior figures also model Christian leadership in a way that is in keeping with the formational aims of the Church in Wales, e.g., encouragement to talk about their own discipleship and engagement with the local community, and that key staff live in different parts of Wales and so engage in the same required travelling as candidates.
- 12. By its very structure, collaboration also happens with various bodies within the Church in Wales. The Principal reports annually to the Governing Body and the Representative Body, and engages regularly with the Executive Board, Ministry Bishop and the Bench of Bishops. Staff meet with each bishop and their teams at least every six months to discuss candidates and matters of concern.

#### **Commendation 1**

St Padarn's is a collaborative community of formation with God's mission at the fore and an infectious zeal for the Gospel. All candidates are encouraged and expected to be pioneering in their approach to ministry and mission.

#### **Commendation 2**

# The Principal and staff have a clear and deliberate focus on building strong relationships with members of the Executive Board, Bishops and key stakeholders.

- 13. However, whilst co-training candidates for different ministries and settings has many positives, the reviewers question whether the distinctiveness of the several ministry strands (distinctive deacon, priest, pioneer and a range of lay ministries) is sufficiently built into discernment, selection and training. Candidates in FLM and NLM programmes and their supervising ministers consistently described a lack of clarity and confusion about the distinct nature of the ministry which candidates had been selected for. The downside of having one set of Formative Expectations for ordained and lay candidates is that they tend to be generic, rather than specific. Therefore, whilst there was clear evidence with candidates of a sense of individual calling, the call of the Church was less clear to them. Consequently, candidates spoke about not understanding the potential development of their future ministry or how in practice they could and should collaborate with others. Supervisors and candidates consistently noted that they were unaware in concrete terms of what ministerial tasks they should focus on at different stages of formation to enable them to fully inhabit and exercise the ministry to which they had been called.
- 14. The Ordinal encapsulates the three-fold order of ministries as the Church in Wales has received them. In addition, the Standing Doctrinal Commission were asked to '...take up the challenge of articulating the way in which ordained ministry contributed to the well-being of Christ's Church and to its mission to witness to Christ's love and God's reign in a largely secularised and multi-faith nation', with their resulting reflections gathered in the 2021 report, 'Faithful Stewards in a Changing Church: Understanding the Ordained Ministry in Light of the 2020 Vision'.
- 15. 'The Church Serving God's World' report included some discussion about lay ministry, but there seems to be no consistent suite of lay ministries. The tension between what is done provincially and what is done locally at a diocesan level is evident. It might well be right that each diocese identifies and shapes forms of lay ministry appropriate to local need and context, yet all are trained at St Padarn's who work to the steer from the Bench. The reviewers noted the significant fall in candidates for licensed lay ministry in the Church in Wales, which is likely to be impacted by a lack of clarity about those ministries.
- 16. The need to prioritise a review of discernment and selection process was widely recognised during interviews. Significantly, it is included under the 'main duties and responsibilities' of the Director of Ministry Development who must: 'Ensure that the discernment processes of the Church in Wales for licensed ministry are rigorous, well-structured and have clear, assessable criteria that are effective in testing vocational call, particularly in relation to groups who are presently underrepresented.'
- 17. The reviewers did not see evidence of a provincial vocations strategy to proactively call out a range of people to diverse ordained and lay ministries to serve the needs of mission. In addition to a steep decline in LLM vocations, in interviews and documentation we heard that there were not enough stipendiary clergy to fill posts.

### **Wider Strategic Recommendation 2**

That the Bench of Bishops articulate more clearly the different forms of ordained and lay ministry, including a nuanced understanding of different forms of lay ministry and considering what can appropriately be agreed provincially and what should be agreed or nuanced at a diocesan level.

## **Wider Strategic Recommendation 3**

That the Bench of Bishops work with the Director of Ministry Development to develop a vocations strategy that ties in clearly with workforce planning in the coming years and consider how the provincial discernment and selection process might be re-shaped to ensure the Church is calling the candidates it needs and to train the ministers it requires to enable mission and evangelism.

#### **Recommendation 1**

That St Padarn's staff continue to develop their collaborative working with the Bench of Bishops and individual dioceses to form effective partnerships in the light of ongoing formation, development and discernment of calling to meet the needs of God's mission.

- 18. In interviews with a variety of candidates and teaching sessions, the reviewers observed that the admirable aim of enabling all candidates to minister across a breadth of theological tradition (an inevitable requirement of the formation of ministry areas) and avoidance of unhelpful labels, led to some lack of confidence and opportunities for candidates to learn and be formed through explicit discussion of the richness brought about by that breadth of tradition. The Church in Wales does not have the same sense of clear theological traditions as the Church of England, but there is nevertheless theological breadth which is a feature of Churches of the Anglican Communion and in wider ecumenical debate. During teaching sessions, we observed more than one occasion where staff moved the session on when a candidate had made a point (though staff were certainly not dismissive), rather than using the opportunity to discuss some aspect of theological diversity. St. Padarn's is clearly a community in which candidates are mutually supportive and learn that diversity does not have to lead to division and therefore a 'safe' place for such discussions to take place.
- 19. Reviewers also noted that the creation of ministry areas has increased the need for collaboration, flexibility and clear leadership skills but has not led to any significant decrease in the breadth of theological tradition of worshipping communities. The Archbishop, Ministry Bishop and diocesan stakeholders expressed a clear missional need for candidates to train and deploy from particular theological traditions. The reviewers felt that some further work on the challenges and opportunities provided by theological breadth in the Church in Wales perhaps by the Standing Doctrinal Commission might then be encapsulated within the principles and qualities in the Formative Expectations for Licensed Ministry, which shape much of St Padarn's work.

#### **Wider Strategic Recommendation 4**

That the Bench of Bishops initiate work on the challenges and opportunities of theological breadth within the Church in Wales, including issues of Anglican ecclesiology, missiology, worship and

spirituality and then give clear direction to the staff at St Padarn's about the impact of this on training and formation.

#### **Recommendation 2**

That St Padarn's staff identify appropriate and constructive opportunities for debate and discussion between those from different theological traditions.

- 20. One of the clear areas of development in the past six years has been a focus on Welsh language and culture, seen as an expected element of worship alongside a requirement for all candidates to learn Welsh. There has been a clear policy of increasing Welsh speaking staff at St Padarn's and a strategic aim of increasing the number of Welsh speaking ordinands.
- 21. The recent appointment of the Tutor in Welsh Theology signals a further aim of 'doing' theology in Welsh and raising up Welsh theologians, with the postholder: 'Supporting learning through the medium of Welsh, and from the perspective of Welsh culture, history and theology, throughout St Padarn's programmes. Leading the work of increasing vocations and theological learning among Welsh speakers.'
- 22. To do this, the review team recommend that the Bench of Bishops considers the identification of potential theological educators through the discernment and selection process (an established practice within the Church of England), which would provide a much clearer pathway for training and formation in order that St Padarn's can more easily target those candidates that should be pushed academically.

### **Commendation 3**

The strategic aims surrounding engagement with Welsh language and culture are clearly effective within the staff and student bodies at St Padarn's.

#### **Recommendation 3**

That the Bench of Bishops might consider the identification of potential theological educators through the discernment and selection process to encourage the raising up of Welsh theologians.

- 23. This PER is in some senses a culmination of a process of review and evaluation of the first six years of the Institute and the formulation of the new Strategic Direction 2022-2028 in response to identified missional needs. St Padarn's is clearly an institute that demonstrates good self-awareness, evidenced in the clarity and honesty of their SWOT analysis. The review team would encourage the continuation of a methodical review process in conjunction with the Executive Board and Bench of Bishops and making best use of such opportunities as the Principal's annual appraisal to clarify and set yearly targets for St Padarn's.
- 24. Whilst engagement with Welsh language and culture is a clear priority, St Padarn's has identified the need for widening diversity in other ways. The Strategic Direction for 2022-2028 includes the aim of 'unlocking potential and widening participation' and says: 'The call in this next phase is to work proactively with dioceses to widen participation', acknowledging that much of this needs to

happen at a local, rather than provincial level. The inclusivity of the student body was positive in relation to gender ratio, prior educational achievement and UKME which includes first-language Welsh speakers. However, the review team noted a significant lack of black and Asian diversity. Whilst parts of Wales have a predominance of white Welsh or British ethnicity, the population-dense centres of South Wales - particularly where English is the first language - have a long history of international migration. The new apprenticeship framework developed ecumenically within the Welsh Government's scheme demonstrates a desire to align the Church in Wales with the strategic aims of the government in terms of widening participation.

#### **Commendation 4**

The new ecumenical apprenticeship framework is an imaginative and outward looking way of seeking to foster widening participation and diversity within the Church in Wales.

25. In interviews with bishops and stakeholders, reviewers heard some concerns about whether the current training pathways exclude or deter some potential candidates, such as women with young families or other caring responsibilities. St Padarn's is certainly flexible in forming individual pathways for candidates, but the full-time route can demand a significant amount of weekly travel for candidates from north Wales in particular who travel each week to Llandaff. St Padarn's necessarily works within geographical and practical constraints, but we recommend further discussion with the Bench of Bishops about the possibility of identifying additional training pathways that might be more accessible for some potential candidates. The Archbishop suggested it would be desirable for St Padarn's to explore whether there could be a completely contextual form of training to enable wider participation, e.g., for women with young families.

### **Recommendation 4**

That St Padarn's undertake further discussion with the Bench of Bishops about the possibility of identifying and resourcing additional training pathways that might be more accessible to some potential candidates.

- A3 The TEI's aims, activity and achievement are understood and supported by wider church audiences.
- 26. St Padarn's has worked hard at its public profile, but it would be fair to say that the closure of St Michael's College was not received well by all in the Church in Wales and St Padarn's is still in the early years of its development. The concept of mixed mode training (part residential, part context-based) is also something comparatively new in the Church in Wales so there is an ongoing process of education and culture change. The St Padarn's website is clear and engaging and the teaching and support staff of St Padarn's are friendly and responsive. The Principal and his team have worked hard on building strong relationships with the Chief Executive of the Representative Body and Bench of Bishops, alongside key staff such as DDOs within each diocese.
- 27. The reviewers discerned some sense that the Bench of Bishops values, but perhaps does not fully understand St Padarn's. Having a bishop with a specific brief for taking the lead on matters of ministry, part of which is engagement with St Padarn's, has clearly been beneficial and enabled

focused discussions and a bridge between the Bench and Institute. The new role of Director of Ministry Development aims to ensure that: 'vision for ministry is clear, widely agreed and well communicated; strategies are approved, embedded, communicated, regularly critiqued and adjusted; operating procedures and protocols gain wide agreement as a result of a comprehensive process of consultation and are clearly documented so that compliance with them becomes instinctive and normative' (see further section C1).

28. Whilst St Padarn's has very good and accessible staff and publicity, their unique position as the training arm for the whole Church in Wales means that – unlike TEIs in the Church of England - they are not required to compete for candidates. Rather the size and make-up of the student body is reliant on the effectiveness of the vocational discernment and selection processes of the Church in Wales.

# **Section B: Formational Context and Community**

- B1 The TEI draws on partnership with theological educators in the region and local faith and community organisations to enhance formational opportunities for students.
- 29. Relationships with partner universities are strong and make a positive contribution to the life of St Padarn's. There is an important longstanding relationship with a Welsh HE institution in University of Wales Trinity St David's (UWTSD), where a named contact has a long history of working with St Padarn's, making the processes and management smooth. Establishing a new partnership with Durham University has brought further gain in opening up additional opportunities e.g., for staff development through the Common Awards networks. St Padarn's academic staff have a variety of connections with these and other institutions, for example as professor, external examiner, research fellow or honorary lecturers many of these relationships are specifically with Welsh institutions (e.g., UWTSD, Cardiff University etc). The establishment of the Durham partnership has been achieved in line with St Padarn's priorities (for example, incorporating the facility for Welsh marking). An experienced Registrar (and team) manages these relationships strategically and well.

#### **Commendation 5**

St Padarn's has a stable and strong network of external/partner relationships, which can support rigorous learning and meaningful staff development.

- 30. Whilst there are no other TEIs specifically serving the Church in Wales, there is evidence of engagement with and learning from English TEIs for example, the Principal's regular contact with English TEI principals, or staff engagement through Common Awards. St Padarn's has developed a particular expertise through its MA programmes in Chaplaincy and Youth & Children schemes which aim to serve the Church in Wales, but further to be sector-leading within the UK as a whole.
- 31. St Padarn's collaborates with the National Welsh for Adults Centre (NWfAC), to support its missional aims as well as to pursue the broader Welsh Government agenda for Welsh language development. This collaboration offers rich provision: taught classes, the possibility of short-term placements, a small fund for intensive courses and most recently the provision of increased tutorial resource, allowing the learning groups to be divided into 4 (not 3) discrete levels. There remains occasional resistance from some candidates towards Welsh language study some would prefer to prioritise biblical languages, some are hesitant given that they live and minister in English-speaking contexts, some highlight that the lessons are conversational-oriented, rather than liturgically focused. (The NWfAC approach is the 'Welsh in the Workplace' programme.)
- 32. 'Beginning Chaplaincy' is a five-day induction course for chaplains engaged in health or social care and a good example of the sort of partnership St. Padarn's has established. It has been designed around the experience and needs of new or recently appointed chaplains. Beginning Chaplaincy complements in-house induction programmes and local management and supports chaplains in being safe and effective practitioners who can make a distinctive contribution to their organisation and is built upon the UKBHC Competencies Framework. All chaplains and volunteers are welcome to apply, regardless of their religion or belief.

#### **Commendation 6**

St Padarn's are commended for their effective collaboration with external bodies via partnerships in relation to NWfAC and chaplaincy.

- 33. On the whole, reviewers saw only limited engagement with a wider ecumenical scene in Wales, though we recognise that may reflect reality on the ground, not any intentional distance on St Padarn's part.
- 34. The Theology for Life programme, opening up particularly the certificate-level course for lay people aside from any formal ministerial training route, is an offer for the wider Church in Wales. This has clearly been a useful tool for those already exploring some form of discernment process.
- B2 There are well understood and embedded practices of corporate life so as to enhance students' formation.
- 35. The importance of 'community' within St Padarn's strapline 'Formation in Community for Mission' was evident in all our interactions with the college. Particularly striking was the non-hierarchical nature of interaction between staff, with academic, domestic and operational/managerial employees all relating extremely warmly with one another. We believe this powerfully sets the culture into which learners come and lays the groundwork for the 'team' ethos of ministry which St Padarn's is rightly keen to equip. This was true in the full-time (FT) Cardiff community as well as at the residential weekends we visited for example, PER reviewers and learners being greeted and 'checked in' by academic tutors.

#### **Commendation 7**

St Padarn's has a strong and attractive team ethos, building a culture which demonstrates a true valuing of individuals. Staff live out and model this culture exceptionally well.

- 36. The community of learners appeared appropriately at ease with itself, with an ever-deepening awareness of and empathy for those from a different background/context. Within the FT community, for example, there was evident anxiety from Cardiff-based candidates for the additional strain placed on those who must travel long distances and so on.
- 37. Part-time (PT) learners expressed delight that 'we feel no segregation when we're here [at residentials with FT learners]', apparently in contrast to a particular historic cohort where there had been some difficulties. Nevertheless, there is a clear perception among part-time learners that they are 'out of the loop' between residential events: a degree of envy was expressed towards the full-time candidates who have access to additional learning activities such as guest lectures.

#### **Recommendation 5**

That St Padarn's explore occasional possibilities for PT candidates to gain from/participate in some of the specific FT programme.

38. Against that perceived 'loss' for part-time learners, being part of the weekly Cardiff community undoubtedly places very substantial demands on the full-time learners, whether this be the

difficulties of extended journeys given the road geography of Wales, or the burden placed upon families - for example, even local candidates tend to 'leave' families to come and stay onsite for 48 hours each week. Whilst St Padarn's has offered some deeply engaged and theological reflection on the grounding for this approach to training and formation, in conversation with Bishops and DDOs the reviewers heard anxiety about the model precluding some potential vocations because of its demanding nature. The issue arises where the model directs those training for stipendiary ministry into the FT training mode – in itself this may be appropriate, but the design of the weekly 48-hour gathering is what raises the logistical challenge.

#### **Recommendation 6**

That St Padarn's continue to evaluate whether a weekly 48-hour gathering is the best fit for delivering the desired FT FLM Cardiff outcomes, or whether other patterns of meeting (e.g. for longer periods, less often) might be viable alternatives.

- 39. In between the 'gathered' modes in FLM, of weekly Cardiff or termly residential, the primary locus of formational community is the formational cell, although for FT candidates this coincides with the in-person presence on a Weds-Fri. The formational cell is a distinct element of the St Padarn's model, separate from the placement, theology programme and residentials. The quality of these groups depends heavily on the skill and capacity of the formational cell 'guide' with some candidates reporting highly positive but occasionally others fairly negative experiences. Largely through informal networking, St Padarn's have sought to shore up and strengthen that team of guides over recent years and have a regular programme of engagement with all guides, including an annual expectations/best practice sharing meeting and offering anonymised candidate feedback, to which the Director of Formation is now adding some more personalised meetings with each guide to seek and supply their personal training and development needs.
- 40. Part-time learners meet less frequently in formational cells, and again, given the geography, almost exclusively online we heard some reports of groups simply not meeting as often as expected, although it was not clear if the learners had shared this information with St Padarn's. For part-time learners, this is a further online meeting in addition to their regular facilitated learning groups and appeared to have less consistently positive association.

#### **Recommendation 7**

That St Padarn's maintain the recent focus on development and support of Formational Cell Guides and offer clearer articulation, especially to PT candidates, of the purpose and value of Formational Cells, to ensure all candidates value this element of the model.

41. In a group of new first year candidates, the reviewers heard some frustration about some of the pre-start practicalities – for example, being notified only at a very late stage of where placements would be. However, this was consistently contrasted with highly positive feedback about the responsiveness, communication and pastoral support offered once candidates have 'arrived' or 'started' their training. St Padarn's staff, tutorial and operational alike, are consistently perceived as flexible, accessible and genuinely concerned for the individual candidates and their needs.

- 42. St. Padarn's has worked hard to offer an inclusive and accessible environment for learners with additional needs. Despite the challenges of an old and complex building, disability access is well-managed where issues have been flagged, again the staff have been responsive and a number of individuals specifically commented on the creative and tireless willingness of the wider community to offer support.
- 43. The Church in Wales is committed to managing safeguarding concerns and promoting safeguarding through its Provincial Safeguarding Team. The Church in Wales's website sets down clear policy, practices, training requirements and reporting procedures for anyone working with children or adults in Wales, whether in a paid or unpaid role. This is in line with the Wales Safeguarding Procedures produced as statutory guidance by the Welsh Government. The Procedures clearly state that 'Safeguarding is everyone's business' and clarify what is required of people in specific roles. Candidates receive safeguarding training throughout their theological training. This is delivered by the Church in Wales safeguarding specialists but supported by and integrated into wider formation by the St. Padarn's team, so that training is delivered by experts within a theological as well as safeguarding context.
- 44. Family life is a challenge for the training model at St Padarn's. For part-time learners, the training offers the least material 'disruption', though the training demand remains significant. Full-time learners described the impact on family life as substantial, though this would be at least as true of full-time training delivered at all TEIs. The full-time Cardiff community are welcoming to families and, where accommodation allows, the reviewers were very confident visiting family would be warmly embraced; and regular family worship and a shared meal takes place every Thursday evening. In practical terms this is only accessible to local candidates on a regular basis, however, much as more geographically distant families might appreciate it. Full-time, onsite accommodation is currently under-occupied, though one or two couples have made use of that.
- 45. Support for spouses and partners is therefore also limited. One tutor's spouse has sought to lead some work in this area previously, but given the dispersed nature of families, it is very hard to see what additional investment in this area could achieve, though anecdotal evidence suggests some desire for the opportunity of greater family engagement.

#### **Recommendation 8**

St Padarn's and its diocesan partners should consider intentionally extending diocesan support initiatives (e.g. for clergy spouses) to include spouses and partners of those in training at St Padarn's. This would have the benefit of making the connections across the college community whilst being more geographically alert and accessible.

46. The use of online learning and formation is perceived as a positive both by staff and learners – issues with the dispersed learning approach e.g., part-time facilitated groups were not particularly to do with 'online' per se but, for example, more related to access to tutors etc, which would not be resolved by the groups meeting in person. The tutorial staff have given some consideration to the ways in which online can be used well, and one senior tutor recently presented on St Padarn's overall positive experience of online learning and formation at BIAPT.

# B3 The provision of public social and private living accommodation is satisfactory.

- 47. Physical premises divide into two categories: hotels/university facilities (for summer school and termly residentials hotels are selected from around Wales on a rotating basis) and the Cardiff site.
- 48. The hotels visited provide good conference facilities and enable the Church in Wales to express something of its appreciation for the candidates who are investing their lives in training and service. They provide good opportunities for relational interaction and are fairly well equipped for on-site teaching. Provision of worship facilities was slightly less effective allocating a conference room which bears enough of the distinctive and marked atmosphere to function as a chapel is challenging. Indeed, though noting the obvious difficulty of such a request, some part-time candidates named a particular longing for a dedicated or 'special' site to meet, where a separate chapel could lend the whole residential experience a different level of spiritual character which they felt was slightly lacking. The residentials are the only occasions when the part-time learners are physically gathered, so their whole experience tends to be in hotels.
- 49. 2022's summer school was hosted at a Pontypridd venue there were some significant accessibility issues but, with customary concern and diligence, these have been actively addressed so that more specific requirements are now fixed for future bookings at this site.
- 50. As a historic and listed building, St Padarn's Llandaff site functions fairly well according to its needs, offering discrete accommodation, teaching and learning, interaction, and worship space.
- 51. The overnight accommodation offered to full-time learners (Weds-Fri) is functional and basic, but clean and warm. Because the rooms are sometimes used at other points in the weeks, candidates have a locked cupboard in which they can store belongings between visits, but this arrangement does make it hard for the rooms to feel like a true 'home from home.'
- Teaching is accommodated in variously-sized rooms, mostly equipped with up-to-date technology to allow hybrid groups as needed. These rooms have the character of the old building, and there is a contrast between the 'feel' of many some are functional seminar spaces, others large rooms with vast high ceilings but they fit the current scale of St Padarn's. There is a desire to expand the library area, as discussed elsewhere in this report (see section D2), although given the physical constraints of the building, achieving this will be challenging. Hearing loops are either in place or planned in the development schedule for 2023, for all teaching rooms.
- 53. The chapel is a large and significant building within the overall Llandaff estate and provides the focus for the worshipping life of the college. Originally constructed and ordered with a primary orientation towards eucharistic worship, the current variety of styles and forms of worship across the college community do experience some constraint in this, and it is evident that the building itself is in some need of care and attention e.g., flaking plasterwork.

#### **Recommendation 9**

That St Padarn's explore possibilities for enhancing the worship space, either through re-ordering of the chapel for flexibility, or using other spaces as appropriate.

- 54. Socialising/interacting space is relatively limited there are two common rooms for learners but the refectory does provide a central social focus for the community. Some learners expressed a desire for creating some additional social activity areas e.g., with table tennis or some such facility as college life can very easily be highly sedentary.
- 55. Facilities for staff seem adequate, with most having either their own office or sharing with one other such offices are of a good size and provide well for 1:1 or 1:2 meetings. There is a substantial staff room, previously the Principal's study, which is expressly available to all staff, not just academic tutors, throughout the week.
- 56. Full-time onsite living accommodation for candidates who wish to move to Cardiff is available, but not heavily used, since few candidates and their dioceses wish candidates to move to Cardiff.
- As an integrated part of the Church in Wales, St Padarn's is included within the Representative Body's commitment to being Carbon Neutral by 2030. At this stage an environmental audit has been commissioned and its results are currently being assessed/drawn into an action plan. Online learning clearly reduces the travel footprint for some learners, though many miles do remain a necessity for the model overall.
- 58. Beyond the matters listed above, immediate priorities for development to the Cardiff site include improvements to the car park, heating system and external signage. Whilst day-to-day responsibility for the site and grounds maintenance lies with St Padarn's, the property is held by the RB, which is therefore the appropriate locus for development and budgetary decision-making. The Strategic Direction 2022-28 paper helpfully identifies the need for 'a rigorous assessment of the best way of meeting the institute's building needs, over a 10-year horizon' to enable wise and prudent investment decisions to be made.
- 59. Pre-pandemic, St Padarn's had an office in North Wales and several people raised the question with the reviewers of whether St Padarn's could or should have some sort of resource base at least in the north of the province.
- B4 The TEI's corporate worship and liturgy are balanced in range and tradition, including authorised and innovative rites.
- 60. The worshipping pattern for the FT Cardiff community offers a wide range of different services, from a Eucharist which opens every week's programme, to instances of the Daily Office, a family service and a closing gathering. Within this spread, the reviewers experienced a range of liturgy and styles of worship, principally led by the candidates themselves, but with good and judicious staff involvement. Staff attendance was clear and good throughout. Each week's services are planned by a learner group, under the guidance of a staff member, ensuring the services and their leadership are inclusive of different individuals, approaches and liturgies. Feedback is offered to

- the group by a staff member, who seeks the learners' own reflections on how the week has gone, steering and offering insight as appropriate. This is an effective model.
- 61. The range of different services offers good opportunity for experimentation either to try new things altogether, or to try approaches which are unfamiliar to an individual leader although given the concentration of such variety within a 48-hour period each week, the reviewers wondered how well the schedule works to help candidates form a regular and ongoing pattern of daily prayer and worship (see section E4).
- 62. The more challenging setting for good and healthy patterns and practice of worship is the residential component, given the reality that these take place in hotels, i.e., venues generally without specific 'worship' space. Whilst designated rooms are allocated to function as the 'chapel' for a weekend, reviewers noted very little use of such space outside of designated worship sessions, and candidates' approach to such sessions was mixed: a number arrived late or would still be talking to one another as the leader had begun. This was in marked contrast to the FT Cardiff experience, where candidates arrived promptly and used time in advance of each service to prepare themselves according to their own tradition.

#### **Recommendation 10**

That St Padarn's explore opportunities to create more of a sense of 'space' within the residential programme, including attention to the physical environment for worship and potential for the facility for learners to 'retreat' or reflect throughout the programme.

- 63. All services reviewers attended included some elements in Welsh as a minimum, this would involve one bible reading, though at other times, usually depending on the leader, it could incorporate substantial further elements including sung worship.
- B5 Staff model an appropriate pattern of spirituality, continued learning and reflection on practice.
- 64. Learners have good access to college staff, both in Cardiff and at residentials. Meals and worship are all shared, and mutual interaction between staff and learners is very strong: as one example, the reviewers witnessed genuinely formational conversations taking place in the lunch queue. The mix of gathered and dispersed elements of the St Padarn's model naturally constructs effective and appropriate boundaries to ensure the staff's 'openness' is not abused. However, time and again reviewers heard testimony to the responsiveness and pastoral concern of all staff again, academic and operational when queries or concerns are raised outside the gathered programme.
- 65. The staff model a calm, but intentional approach to both leading and participating in the ongoing culture of 'formation in community for mission.' Academic staff regularly share insights from their own ministry, research or simply their own discipleship journeys and outside the classroom all staff are very evidently engaged in a constant review of the effectiveness of their activity, be that their teaching, or areas for which they have leadership or policy responsibility. This substantially enables the palpable culture of curiosity, openness and care throughout St Padarn's.

66. Although St Padarn's eschews the standard labels of tradition or churchmanship, the current staff does represent a fairly good range. In this, they model comfort and security within their own tradition, whilst being open and humble enough to engage creatively and effectively with one another. Humour is a trademark and generates an appropriate level of informality, whilst always maintaining the appropriate balance of staff authority and a common sense of shared discipleship and ongoing formation.

## **Commendation 8**

St Padarn's staff are particularly effective at modelling appropriate patterns of spirituality, learning and reflection.

# **Section C: Leadership and Management**

# C1 The TEI has clear and effective governance structures.

- 67. St Padarn's has clear yet complex governance, oversight and management structures.
- 68. Within the Church in Wales, responsibility for theological education, formation and training rests with the Bench of Bishops. The Bench of Bishops is responsible for determining the scope of activities that it wishes St Padarn's to carry out. St Padarn's Institute operates on a conferred powers model of governance as opposed to a reserved powers model. The Bench of Bishops choose one of their number to hold the Ministry Portfolio. The Ministry Portfolio includes acting as the primary link between the Bench and St Padarn's Institute.
- 69. As the single provincial TEI for the Church in Wales, St Padarn's Institute is not an independent legal entity. St Padarn's is an activity of the Representative Body of the Church in Wales (RB). Its Principal and staff are employees of the RB or, in a very few cases, seconded office holders, its budget is a significant component of the overall RB budget and key activities (People, Finance, ICT, Property, Legal etc) are integrated with and draw on the resources of other constituent parts of the RB's national operational activities. The trustees of the RB have responsibility for St Padarn's as an activity of the RB; this includes oversight of its statutory Prevent responsibilities and its legal and contractual commitments.
- 70. Governance oversight of St Padarn's is shared between the Bench and the Representative Body which discharge their routine responsibilities as follows.
- 71. The Strategic Development Plan for the Institute, to set its medium-term direction, is agreed by the Bench of Bishops, and approved by the Representative Body, though the 2022-28 plan has yet to receive formal agreement.
- 72. The Bench of Bishops has established the St Padarn's Institute Quality and Standards Panel to, on its behalf, provide governance level assurance about the quality of teaching, excellence of student experience and to ensure that steps are being taken to foster a culture of continuous improvement. The St Padarn's Institute Quality and Standards Panel will be chaired by a lay person with relevant, senior higher education experience and report on its activities to both the Bench of Bishops and the RB.
- 73. The RB exercises its day-to-day trustee responsibilities through its Finance Committee, its People Committee and its Audit and Risk Committee. Those bodies monitor the financial and operational performance of St Padarn's. The Principal and the Director of Operations attend these committees when required. The RB is the place where formal trustee oversight is exercised and where formal trustee approval is granted. The Principal reports annually to the RB, ensuring that it can fulfil its role of being collectively responsible and accountable for the institution's activities.
- 74. The Principal is responsible for the day-to-day operations of the St Padarn's Institute. For the entire breadth of his duties and responsibilities, he is line-managed by and accountable to the Ministry Bishop and the Chief Executive jointly, and the Principal meets regularly with both. Long

- term planning and the strategic development of training, therefore, are seen through the eyes of the Representative Body and the Bench of Bishops, rather than being initiated and fully led by the Principal and staff of St. Padarn's.
- 75. The Executive Board of St Padarn's is Chaired by the Chief Executive and its membership comprises the Ministry Bishop, the Principal, the Dean for Initial Ministerial Training, the Dean for Discipleship, the Director of Operations and the Quality and Governance Officer (Secretary). The EB meets monthly in order to facilitate the strategic involvement of the Chief Executive and the Ministry Bishop in St Padarn's Institute and to oversee the functioning of St Padarn's as an integrated part of the Representative Body.
- The Academic Board of St Padarn's is the senior academic decision-making body of the TEI in relation to all of its university-accredited programmes. It meets termly and is Chaired by the Principal. The purpose of the Academic Board is to oversee the quality assurance, enhancement, strategic development and on-going shape of the university accredited awards offered by the Institute. St Padarn's delivers a number of programmes, which are accredited by different institutions. There are individual University Programme Boards for each accrediting institution, namely Durham, Cardiff and Trinity St David, which in turn hold clear individual Terms of Reference, thus ensuring compliance with all partnership agreements. The University Programme Boards hold a wider membership, including the Registrar, the Director of Operations, the Quality and Governance Officer, student representatives and other relevant stakeholders.
- 77. The Senior Leadership Team meets weekly, to provide leadership and coordination to St Padarn's, including review of existing strategic and operational items and future planning. The Senior Leadership Team comprises the Principal, the Director of Operations, the Dean for Discipleship, and the Quality and Governance Officer (Secretary).

#### **Commendation 9**

St Padarn's complex yet clear oversight structures embed the Institute in key wider oversight and accountability structures of the Church in Wales alongside those of partner academic institutions. St Padarn's maintain what appear to be excellent partnerships with validating Universities.

78. The creation of the new Director of Ministry Development post recognises the need for an additional focused role which: '...involves working closely and collaboratively with a wide range of colleagues – Bishops, archdeacons, the Director of Evangelism and Church Growth, Directors of Ministry and their teams, the Principal of St Padarn's and his team. Success will be achieved through strong relationships and clear competence rather than command and control.' We would encourage ongoing review of the success of the role as the job description identifies some key issues and areas to be addressed, but with less specificity about how this can be improved.

#### **Recommendation 11**

That the Chief Executive of the RB and Ministry Bishop, who will both line-manage the Director of Ministry Development, consider ways in which the effectiveness of the new role can be assessed, particularly in relation to further development of the strategic dimension of the work of St Padarn's.

# C2 The TEI has effective team leadership.

- 79. The Principal and staff of St Padarn's consistently display a clear and positive sense of team spirit and collaboration.
- 80. The Strategic Direction 2022-28, which as we note in the introduction has not yet been formally adopted by the Bench of Bishops, sets down a clear vision for strategic development in 'a period of embedding and targeted development.' The document looks back to some degree on the first six years of St Padarn's rightly emphasising its many achievements, despite a third of that time being under the constraints of the Covid 19 pandemic. St Padarn's is an institution which is firmly mission-focused and entrepreneurial and open and responsive to changing needs. A primary example of this are developments in equipping candidates to grow in competency and use of the Welsh language and working with the Welsh government on creating an apprenticeship scheme. This Strategic Direction document also makes clear that St Padarn's Institute is still new as are the major changes in relation to development of mission areas. The shape of lay and ordained ministry and training in the wider Church in Wales involves significant culture change, which will take time.
- 81. The embedded structure of St Padarn's is both a strength and weakness. The potential for the Representative Body, Bench of Bishops and St Padarn's to work collaboratively on issues of mission and ministry enables decisions to be made quite swiftly and largely unhindered by lengthy bureaucratic processes. Personal relationships between the Principal and the bishops seem to be largely positive and constructive. St Padarn's does not have the burden of financial sustainability other TEIs have and candidates across the Church in Wales have access to their training programmes and support.
- 82. However, reliance on the Bench of Bishops to make clear decisions can lead to some feelings of anxiety and frustration for St Padarn's staff. The Bench of Bishops is small and regularly subject to change in its membership and each diocese has a distinctive identity and geography. The Ministry Bishop is also a diocesan and so inevitably has limited time and capacity for these responsibilities. The new post of Director of Ministry Development might help with this capacity issue, though the job description seems to include under 'main responsibilities' a list of the key issues, rather than necessarily a way forward (see section A3).

#### **Recommendation 12**

That the Chief Executive of the RB and Bench of Bishops, in partnership with St Padarn's agree a clear process for developing, agreeing and monitoring strategic direction.

#### **Recommendation 13**

That, after due discussion and any required adjustments, the Bench of Bishops formally agrees the strategic direction of St Padarn's for the coming six years.

- C3 Trustees are appropriately recruited, supported and developed.
- 83. Due to the structure of St Padarn's, the Institute does not have its own Board of Trustees but is accountable to the trustees of the Representative Body, which is made up of up to 26 church

members from across the Church in Wales. Some have been recruited because of the position they hold, for example the Archbishop, or the Chairs of the Diocesan Boards of Finance, others for experience/expertise in relevant areas such as property, banking and investments. Almost half the members are elected by the dioceses – one lay person and one cleric from each diocese.

- 84. There are high levels of professional skills and experience amongst staff in senior managerial and operational roles at St Padarn's. It is evident from the SWOT analysis accompanying the 2022-28 strategic planning that St Padarn's are aware of the threats and opportunities that currently exist in relation to existing staffing structures.
- 85. St Padarn's have undertaken to revise some existing staff roles and to add additional staffing in order to take forward the planned work over the next few years. Thus, a restructure of the Operations team began in 2022, which led to the creation of new roles e.g., Senior Coordinator, Quality and Governance Officer, Registry Administrator. The aim behind the restructure is to release capacity for the Coordinators and create more focus on ensuring data is robust and to facilitate its use in decision-making processes. The last phase remains to be implemented in the autumn/winter of 2022, with extra staff resource being added to the team in the areas of development of media resources, student support and buildings management.
- 86. Full time academic staff at St Padarn's are highly qualified with a good number of them active scholars. The Principal is an honorary professor at UWTSD, and both the Dean for Discipleship and the Dean for Initial Ministerial Training work closely with academic colleagues at UWSTD and supervise doctoral studies. Teaching is increasingly research-led providing a good foundation for the emergence of a theological epistemic community. There is a good system of induction for staff and a culture of continuous improvement (see section D). St Padarn's also aim to undertake a restructure of some existing tutorial roles and add some new tutorial posts soon, to take forward the delivery of targeted strategic development.
- 87. On their website, the Principal emphasises that there are not separate teams academic staff, operational staff and those in active parish/sector ministry but that: 'It's a single team committed to all of St Padarn's activities...We resist the temptation to divide up the work into different silos, celebrating the fact that a staff member who is primarily focused on continuing ministerial development can also contribute to the initial training of lay ministers, that operations staff can lead sessions for curates about change and time management, and academics are stimulated by engaging with the leading-edge aspects of youth and children's ministry, pioneers and chaplains.' The reviewers certainly recognised this team spirit (see section B2).
- 88. In the past year, the first Tutor in Welsh Theology has been appointed and several staff are bilingual (indicated on the website), which is clearly very important in terms of developing candidates' engagement and confidence with Welsh language and culture.
- 89. The regular activities of Programme Boards, Academic Board and Executive Board, together with the managerial oversight from the Principal, hold St Padarn's staff accountable and stimulate and support progress. This is further supported through challenge and input from the Quality and Standards Panel. The regular All Staff meetings are times for staff development and include a

training element, as well as a place for sharing good practice and ideas for developments and improvements across the programmes. There is evidence of a system of feedback and consultation across all areas and every aspect of St Padarn's work.

- 90. In addition, there are continuous staff development opportunities including:
  - HEA accreditation for teaching staff
  - AUA membership for administrative staff
  - Coeliac accreditation for catering staff.
- 91. All staff can receive funding for training.

## C4 The TEI has effective business planning, fundraising, risk management and reporting.

- 92. St Padarn's current Business Plan is set for 2022-28, and it clearly focuses on its scope, implementation, strategic objectives, risks, resources and budgetary implications.
- 93. St Padarn's is the Church in Wales's resource institution for theological education, training, ministerial development and research. Founded on 1 July 2016, it is part of the Representative Body (RB) of the Church in Wales, a body established by Royal Charter in 1919, which is responsible for looking after the assets of the Church in Wales to ensure that resources are available for the benefit of the whole Church.
- 94. The Bench of Bishops set the direction of St Padarn's, identifying what training and resources will be required to help equip the Church for existing and developing ministry. Its staff are RB employees. Its budget is set by the RB and the majority (approx. 90%) of the cost of its work is borne by the RB, though St Padarn's earns a small amount of external income.
- 95. There is no cross-charging to the Church in Wales (dioceses etc.) for St Padarn's activities, the costs are borne directly by the RB through the St Padarn's budget. St Padarn's operates across the whole of Wales and has one physical site in Cardiff. The overall responsibility for the site, as for all Church buildings in the Church in Wales, is held by the Head of Property of the RB. The Head of Property oversees major developments, with much of the day to day running and maintenance delegated to St Padarn's staff. As part of the RB, St Padarn's benefits greatly not just from funding, but from support and expertise in areas such as IT, HR, Legal and Finance, giving it access to a wealth of resource unusual for a TEI.
- 96. St Padarn's first six years have been a period of rapid development to meet the needs of the Church and to fulfil the changing requirements for Higher Education providers. Its core work has been established and it is now entering a period of embedding and targeted development.
- 97. The next phase of St Padarn's strategic direction (as in the 2022-28 Strategic Direction document) targets a number of areas for development, including investment in lay ministry more broadly; unlocking potential and widening participation with the purpose of more closely balancing the demographic represented amongst St Padarn's candidates and thus increasing gender, prioreducation and racial diversity; investing in strategic leadership, in the sense of creating a culture of

- high-level professional development; and capitalising on some of St Padarn's successes, such as Theology for Life and UK Chaplaincy programmes.
- 98. As evident in St Padarn's Annual Self-assessment from August 2022, its SWOT Analysis, and the Principal's report to the Bench of Bishops from 1 February 2022, St Padarn's are aware of output, resources and financial opportunities and threats and have displayed a balanced approach to such. For example, one challenge that St Padarn's face is that of location and the consequent limits on residential training and formation, which was evident from our observations and conversations with staff and candidates, particularly candidates from North Wales, for whom travelling and in effect relocating to Cardiff weekly is problematic. However, it is evident that St Padarn's have considered and will continue to consider different ways of accommodating candidates that are reasonable, proportionate and adequate, as well as financially prudent.
- 99. It appears that staff and candidates are aware of St Padarn's strategic objectives for the next six years, and it is evident that consultative communications take place and are documented regularly such as via Staff Student Consultative Committee meetings. However, this strategic direction must be clearly agreed by the Bench of Bishops to be effective.
- 100. St Padarn's have effective and appropriate budgeting and management accounts with regular reviews and timely annual financial reporting, independently audited and reported to the Representative Body of the Church in Wales. The financial statements of the Representative Body of the Church in Wales, the Statement of Financial Activities, the Balance Sheet, the Cash Flow Statement and notes to the financial statements, include a summary of significant accounting policies. The financial reporting framework that has been applied in their preparation is applicable law and UK Accounting Standards, including Financial Reporting Standard 102 (United Kingdom Generally Accepted Accounting Practice).
- 101. Within the RB, the Audit and Risk Committee works with the Representative Body's external auditors to ensure proper financial reporting practice and compliance with charity accounting requirements. It is also responsible for monitoring the effectiveness of the internal audit function. It also has an important role in overseeing the risk management process and considering the potential financial exposure on safeguarding matters. The Finance Committee is the principal place of detailed engagement and interface between the Representative Body and its staff on matters of financial strategy development; financial planning and budgeting; scrutiny of unbudgeted expenditure proposals; financial arrangements with the diocesan boards of finance; and matters relating to the staff and clergy pension schemes. The RB, and therefore St Padarn's, does not actively engage in fundraising activities though it can receive donations.
- 102. As part of the Representative Body of the Church in Wales St Padarn's comes under the RB Risk Register. This includes all high-level risks common across the whole of the RB, as well as the high-level risks specifically associated with St Padarn's. There is a rolling review of risks undertaken by the RB Senior Leadership Team, with several items being reviewed each month. The Risk Register is scrutinized annually by the RB Audit and Risk Committee, who make recommendations or highlight any concerns to the annual review of the Register by the Trustees of the RB.

103. In order to ensure rigorous management of risks to St Padarn's there is also a St Padarn's Risk Register in place. This identifies risks specific to St Padarn's and goes into more detail on some of the high-level risks identified in the RB Risk Register which may have a particularly significant impact on St Padarn's. Risks identified are clearly defined in distinct categories, wide-ranging from premises-related risks such as fire and flood, to data and IT risks such as GDPR or copyright, and academic programme-related risks such as student numbers, staff, or marking issues etc. This is a live document, involving ongoing review of the Risk Register with several items being reviewed each month, and then the whole Register is reviewed in the summer of each year by the St Padarn's Senior Leadership Team. The risks on the St Padarn's Risk Register are either to an individual programme, or to the organisation as a whole.

### **Commendation 10**

St Padarn's has clear, robust and effective business planning and financial processes with very good risk management, embedded in the overarching RB Risk Register.

# **Section D: Teaching and Learning**

- 104. The 'integrated' teaching and learning environment caters for lay disciples, those in training for both lay and licensed ministries as well as those in continuing ministerial development (CMD) after licensing. Full-time and part-time modes of training are available for candidates training for licensed ministry and perceived to be equally valuable pathways of formation. The integrated model sees those training for lay ministry learning alongside those being formed for ordained ministry in both residential and non-residential contexts.
- 105. The 'formation in context' approach used sees candidates getting class-based instruction (lectures, seminars, tutorials) alongside working on placement in parish ministry under a supervisor. Class-based instruction happens onsite for those in full-time training and online for those who are part-time. Contracted non-stipendiary learning group facilitators are used to support tutorials that are held online. A peripatetic residential training provision is also used to accord part-time candidates opportunities to interact and get input. It is also intended to ensure St Padarn's has a presence in all parts of Wales apart from its Cardiff campus. There is a genuine effort to enculturate formation for ministry in a Welsh context.
- 106. St Padarn's offers validated academic qualifications: The BTh (Theology for Discipleship, Ministry and Mission) with UWTSD and, for those with appropriate qualifications, the MA validated through a partnership agreement with Durham is on offer. The BTh offers six FHEQ Level 4 courses, six level 5 courses and six level 6 courses. There are fifteen FHEQ level 7 courses to support St Padarn's PGT provision of MA programmes. For the 2021/22 intake, there were more MA candidate enrolled (38) than those enrolling for the BTh (36), pointing to St Padarn's ability to recruit qualified candidates to programmes where they are competing in the wider UK market. The validation agreements help to ensure the quality of training on offer and, to some extent also ensures that only those who meet entry requirements are enrolled.
- 107. Full time staff at St Padarn's are highly qualified with a good number of them active scholars. Grants are generous to allow staff to participate in conferences and purchase resources. There are questions about outsourced training and volunteer group facilitators, as we discuss later in this report section. Teaching is increasingly research-led providing a good foundation for the emergence of a theological epistemic community. There is a good system of peer assessment for staff and PDRs, forming a part of a culture for continuous improvement. Although staff are research active and there is evidence of a scholarly and intellectually stimulating environment there is no PGR provision yet. Individual staff members do however co-supervise students enrolled at local universities. Although scholarship is encouraged and supported through provision of support to attend conference and other related theological networking activities the review team has not established the existence of systematic development of a research culture needed to realise the vision of 'Welsh Theology' driven by St Padarn's.
- 108. Whilst there is a research culture at St. Padarn's, it would be beneficial to develop this into a policy to enable consistency of practice. Currently, staff speak informally to academically able

candidates about further academic progression, but this would be assisted if candidates were identified as potential theological educators at the point of selection.

#### **Recommendation 14**

That St Padarn's look to develop a research policy to enable staff and candidates' development and ensure further development of a research culture.

#### **Recommendation 15**

Given the very strong PG taught programme on offer, and the fact that staff are qualified and are already supervising research degrees, that St Padarn's consider launching a validated PG research degree programme.

109. The range of academic programmes and modules should certainly enable growth in learning and knowledge of Christian tradition, faith and life. Reviewers observed in teaching sessions at the FLM residential a normal variance of academic ability in the cohorts of candidates, but some candidates expressed frustration that the more academically able were not consistently given opportunities to be 'pushed' to aid their formation. It was positive to see Hebrew being offered as an online option for all candidates (Hebrew and Greek are offered in alternating years) to enable primary engagement with scripture and encourage able candidates with potential to undertake biblical scholarship in the future. However, the format of the course makes it an unrealistic option for most, reflected in the high dropout rate.

#### **Recommendation 16**

# That St. Padarn's reviews opportunities for learning biblical languages, including the structure and format of teaching and learning.

- 110. A majority of those in training are female and the mean age of 44 suggests that programmes on offer are attracting mature candidates. It may also mean the selection process is not reaching out to younger candidates. Candidates in training are predominantly white, with only one current candidate of black or Asian heritage. This can indicate gaps in the discernment process that require attention in order to ensure the 'called but excluded' can answer their call to training for ministry. The mature nature of the candidates for formation can create challenges as candidates juggle their learning and training for ministry with other demands on their time and attention.
- 111. Evidence during the visit suggests that St Padarn's are providing a supportive and flexible (within reason) environment in which the learning and teaching takes place. Appropriate support is available to candidates throughout training and the validation agreements provide scope for flexibility as needed. Some slight concerns were expressed by some that St Padarn's is not involved in the discernment process and therefore cannot influence who turns up for training or the level of study they can undertake. It is suggested that this be looked at as a priority as part of a review of the discernment and selection process (see A2) as it can undermine the quality of the candidates arriving for training.

# The TEI offers programmes appropriate to the sponsoring church's ministerial training needs.

- 112. The Church in Wales has identified formative expectations to which the programmes at St Padarn's are a response. Indeed, the curriculum mapping documents for both Initial Ministerial Training and Newly Licensed Ministry training show that the taught programmes at UG and PGT derive from these declared ministerial needs. There is evidence of grounded theological training that provides depth and breath. The BTh programme is an excellent example of a programme that engages candidates of various abilities and on different ministerial callings suited to the needs of the Welsh church. The use of 'integrated formation' or formation in context allows the candidates to engage with 'ideal' and 'lived' experiences of mission and ministry practice throughout their learning cycle. Periods of intellectual input provide an engaging environment to acquire the explicit theological knowledge while the placement enables candidates to also acquire the tacit knowledge and skills crucial for ministerial formation. This approach allows formation in situ harnessing the benefits of brief residential input and immersion in the world of ministry from the start of training.
- 113. Similarly, the MA programme offers advanced training and scope for specialism in various areas of ministry. The specialisms (Children and Youth and Chaplaincy) are probably the best such programmes in the UK arguably as good as any in the world?

#### **Commendation 11**

# St Padarn's offers a diverse range of academic programmes, including the provision of specialist MA programmes.

- 114. All the programmes reviewed are world engaging within the context of a Church that seeks a distinctiveness situated in Welsh culture. There is evidence certainly in the syllabi of the courses reviewed that candidates are being exposed to a wide variety of views and are being helped to develop critical thinking and reflection skills that they will need to be effective in ministry. A look at the reading lists of the courses confirms that the teaching and learning material remains contemporary and candidates are getting a good theological education as all the quality reviews have confirmed. Further evidence of this comes from the number of world-renowned speakers and invited guests that engage with the candidates throughout their period of training. This must continue to be encouraged especially given the relative ease with which technology makes this a cheaper and greener alternative to flying in guests. There is also evidence of encouraging wider engagement with the Anglican Communion through exchange visits abroad. Although at the time of the review Covid-19 restrictions had curtailed much of this, those who had participated found this particularly beneficial.
- 115. Recent QA and Partner reviews confirm that the content and processes of UG and PGT programmes conforms with the FHEQ expectations. The BTh UG programme reviewed has appropriate depth and the ILOs set relate to the FHEQ expectations. It is also clear from talking to

the candidates, reviewing the content, and assessed work that the level 4, 5, 6 and 7 courses that support the BTh give candidates the foundational theological knowledge, ministerial skills and attitudes needed to fulfil the formational requirements demanded of them by the Church in Wales. We would encourage St. Padarn's to continue to benchmark the programmes and consider developing further pathways/specialisms for the BTh.

- 116. Our interactions suggests that staff at St. Padarn's know their candidates well and do their best to encourage, support and challenge them, as appropriate. The lack of a recent progress measure makes it difficult to give an exact figure, but our interaction with staff and candidates suggests that some who arrive at St Padarn's from a non-privileged background often with marginal entry qualifications do make the most progress on their formational journey.
- 117. The full-time FLM programme is intended to be for stipendiary candidates, with the Church in Wales explicitly wanting a higher level of investment and formational work in them than in the non-stipendiaries and LLMs, who follow a part-time route. Their two pathways are therefore different and seeking to equip people for different ministries. Both pathways are premised on an integrated approach. Whilst therefore there cannot be parity as such, both programmes must be of good quality in order that candidates can meet their learning outcomes. The reviewers found evidence that there was parity in meeting ILOs across full and part time routes.
- 118. At input level however the review team did note that there are cases where content delivery online has its limitations in relation to ministerial formation and might mean a need to do more for this group. In interviews with part-time candidates there seemed to be some issues related to communication, a limited lack of understanding about formation in some cases and feeling slightly disconnected from St. Padarn's between residentials (see section B2), but they also noted how supportive the staff are and appreciate their flexible approach to training.
- 119. The teaching and learning programmes reviewed relate Faith to Life. In fact, the BTh and MA programmes provide the ministerial formation candidate with an opportunity to study in a reflexive way continually relating the class to actual day-to-day faith practice questions they encounter in society. This report noted earlier (section B2) how the 'formation in community' approach essentially allows candidates to see what theology looks like once it leaves the class, virtual or otherwise. There is evidence from talking to the candidates and placement supervisors that spending part of the week in the community and then engaging with others in class helps to strengthen this faith to life link. We note with satisfaction the efforts to place candidates 'out of their comfort zones' or traditions as good practice that ensures candidates emerge from training with a more rounded understanding of faith traditions and practices. The opportunities to engage with tutors periodically accords candidates a space to resolve the more intriguing questions.

# D2 The TEI's taught programmes are appropriately resourced, developed and quality assured.

120. St Padarn's is in a privileged position with respect to being financed by the RB. It has adequate financial resources to cover its costs and can make appropriate investment in learning for both

staff and candidates. The BTh and MA programmes are taught by highly qualified staff. The taught programmes are regularly quality assessed (QAA and Partner Audits). St Padarn's has good internal structures (QSR Board) and systems (internal and external moderation) to ensure ongoing monitoring of quality. Academic malpractices and cases of candidates with mitigating circumstances though governed by partner agreements are fair and create conditions for the development of learning discipline without being too harsh for candidates on this journey of formation.

121. Learning support at St Padarn's is strong. A highly qualified and effective team, drawing from the expertise across the staff team, provide very tailored and individual support. Professional development has reflected contemporary learning and pedagogical strategies. St Padarn's must be commended also for ensuring the candidates are well supported financially during training. For sponsored candidates there is no charge for undertaking a course of study. The Church in Wales also provides grants for people in full and part-time training for ministry and expenses are provided for travel. The grant is calculated individually dependent on housing, household income and other living costs. Once St Padarn's receives a candidate's sponsor form from their sending Diocese the information is passed on to the Church in Wales Finance department. They will send out more information about grant entitlements and forms to be completed in order to apply for grants.

#### **Commendation 12**

# The learning support given by St. Padarn's staff to candidates with a range of complex needs is excellent.

- 122. Teaching at St Padarn's is well resourced with evidence of investment in new learning technologies and the use of Moodle to support learning. St Padarn's are encouraged to continue to invest and professionalise the staffing of the learning platform particularly if the current dispersed and flexible learning is to be advanced further.
- 123. The library is small but quite efficient. The librarian has a system of posting books to candidates who live some distance from Llandaff and invests in digital books to aid accessibility. It can nevertheless be challenging for candidates living a significant distance from Llandaff to access books and there is currently no agreement for use of the theology collection at UWTSD. Moodle does include clear instructions about using other libraries detailing the access they already have.
- 124. There is a need to move away from the current focus on library services towards a model of a learning hub offering candidates and staff other user services, including studying and wellbeing support, and supporting publications by staff. Similarly, the library is encouraged to create a special collection of St Padarn's publications and to continue to expand books and other materials on Welsh theology and other faiths. They are encouraged to continue to offer candidates diverse views including by authors from other parts of the world to challenge and broaden the horizons of the candidates and aid their formation.

125. A concern the team noted related to the use of volunteer facilitators for the intentional learning groups. These do an invaluable job facilitating sessions designed by tutors and yet there seems not to be a structured way of appraising their work or providing them with feedback. Also, many of these volunteers are highly qualified and experienced and there is a need to create better structures for their support and that mechanisms for regular peer reviews are put in place.

#### **Recommendation 17**

# That St Padarn's give further consideration to the support, review and feedback process for learning group facilitators.

- 126. We are satisfied that quality assurance procedures are operating well. It has been noted elsewhere that governance of quality has been made a priority at St Padarn's. The partner and QA reviews done to date all suggest that internal processes of assessment and moderation of assessed work are working well. These are governed by the partnership agreements for the validated programmes. There are clear procedures for appeals, and these are clearly communicated in the programme handbooks. From the assessed work made available to the review team, it is also clear that tutors are marking fairly and providing good feedback to the candidates.
- 127. The only suggestion particularly important for these candidates for ministerial formation is to ensure that there is also a gradual shift towards more structured feedforward. This can help them more in their process of reflective practice. It may be that this is out of scope of the validation agreements, and it may well be something that tutors take on during their periodic reviews with the candidates.
- 128. Candidates' 'voice' at St Padarn's is heard and respected. Discussions with the candidate representatives showed that they felt respected, and staff are sensitive and willing to listen and help. There is also evidence on campus that St Padarn's are transparent about the issues raised and they give regular feedback to candidates on what issues have been raised and how they have responded. St Padarn's are commended for this. St Padarn's are encouraged to find ways (incentives) of encouraging more participation by candidates in giving feedback on their learning especially individual course unit evaluations.

### **Commendation 13**

# St. Padarn's are commended for the ways in which they seek to listen and respond to the candidates' voice.

- D3 There is a good mix of teaching and learning styles and assessment methods, and students are engaged.
- 129. Staff at St Padarn's use a variety of teaching and learning methods. Traditional lectures alongside seminars, tutorials and structured study are used effectively to engage with candidates catering for the different learning styles of the candidates. Assessment at St Padarn's, though governed through the partner agreements, allows innovation in assessment method although staff continue to rely on the more traditional forms of assessment essays, reflections, journals and some group

work. Given the drive for inclusion and to cater for the different learning styles, St Padarn's are encouraged to continue to broaden their assessment methods including the use of creative methods, posters and other visual methods to suit candidates with neuro divergence as necessary. St Padarn's has developed a blend of online and face to face learning to help it cope with the geography of Wales that imposes travel challenges between the North and South. The use of more peripatetic residentials also ensures a presence across the different geographical areas of Wales.

#### **Recommendation 18**

That St. Padarn's considers some diversification of forms of assignment to encourage the skills of theological reflection and reflective practice and enabling further ministerial formation.

- D4 There is provision for students' progression and development over the course of the learning programmes.
- 130. St Padarn's has been very successful in ensuring candidates arriving for their training and formation make progress. However, an attrition rate of about 10% for the entry cohort suggests some weakness in diocesan/provincial selection processes, leading to bishops removing from training those who have proven to be unsuitable for ordained or licensed lay ministry. In most of these cases it is St. Padarn's who have identified significant concerns, e.g., in safeguarding, ongoing moral failings etc.
- 131. Some candidates might also not be prepared for the demands of their UG programme when they begin training (see section A 2). This presents the challenge of how best to support those who are called but lack the some of the qualities to cope with the demands of the programme and emphasises the need (already mentioned) for clarification about provincial and diocesan responsibilities. Overall, it is pleasing to note that St Padarn's has shown an ability to progress where possible with candidates. The fact that integrated formation is used as an approach also allows the candidate to progress both intellectually and formationally in situ. Discussion with candidates and in teaching observation suggested staff at St Padarn's encourage the development of independent critical thinking.

# D5 Students are helped to integrate their academic learning and ministerial development.

- 132. The integrated model of formation in community approach used at St Padarn's allows candidates to integrate their academic learning with in-situ ministerial development. Reflective practice is an important part of their learning and development. For the candidates, the placement requirement helps them link their academic learning to the practices they encounter in day-to-day ministry. Regular tutorials allow candidates to process their experiences against this background of the academic programme.
- 133. The structure of the assessment especially for level 5 courses is instructive as it encourages them to additionally write a 1000-word reflection. Candidates are encouraged to become theologically reflexive thinkers with evidence of much success in this. During our visit it was clear that as the

candidates returned from their placement, they were given space to think about their experiences with others and with their tutors. Also evident is the extent to which candidates continually surprised themselves ministerially venturing into areas and traditions that were out of their comfort zones. We noted some really good examples of peer-to-peer learning and perhaps of some evidence that 'the broad church' approach in use here may be yielding some good peer-to peer encounters that are good for ministerial formation learning.

- 134. There are some signs of the 'church coming into the classroom.' The Leading Healthy Churches programme, for FT FLM candidates only, offers regular opportunity to hear from expert practitioners substantially, those ministering in Wales, but some from further afield including English and international. Topics covered recently include: rural ministry, environmental issues, vocations, Prevent policy and so on. During the visit, reviewers also observed a Level 5 Exploring Missional Church module visit from a National Director of Alpha, and at a residential some taught input on pastoral care, and the limits of priestly ministry, was provided by a practising minister who is also qualified as a psychotherapist.
- 135. In terms of evidence for the 'classroom being put into practice', there are a small number of creative assignments within FLM e.g., creating a proposal for a New Christian Community, though most continue to retain a substantial 'essay-style' response. At Level 5, each module now includes a principal assignment (3000 words) plus a 1000-word reflection on 'how the module has connected to their ministry and discipleship'.
- 136. The primary place for 'church' and 'classroom' to interact, however, is the placement. Aside from its place in the structure of St. Padarn's model, this is most consistently the answer reviewers heard from candidates whenever we explored the question an answer which was frequently followed by a comment on the importance of the selection and matching of placement supervisors. St. Padarn's has recently appointed a new Tutor for Contextual Learning and reviewers heard positive evidence about his strongly relational approach.
- 137. The Placement Training Agreement is fairly bald, and largely functional, concerned with how many times a candidate will preach in a given year, for example. Formalising what is expected from the placement in terms of reflective engagement between learning and practice, and what support is offered to upskill both candidate and supervisor in this regard would be helpful. Conceptually, the weekend/summer school residentials are intended also to be highly significant moments in the overall programme where learning and practice engage: no credit bearing modules are taught through these residential elements but teaching which engages practical skill combined with speakers who speak to the broader formational task is offered. The number of such opportunities clearly places limitations on how much of this kind of teaching can be offered, and reviewers were regularly reminded (by learners) that these ministerial training elements must be confined to residentials, as the theological teaching is shared with those on Theology for Life. Guest lectures and Leading Healthy Churches provide additional opportunities for the FT community.
- 138. To the extent that the expectations of the placement are clear, and care has been taken to ensure the respective training incumbents understand the expectations and have time to train others, this

model works well. For this review, the question is whether the placements are working as well as they could. It appears to be – as can be expected – that there is a variable picture depending on the quality of the placement supervisor. We believe there is a need to continue to develop the placement process, ensuring that placement supervisors are systematically selected and inducted to support the candidates. We suggest here that this is not simply about the paperwork but ensuring that only placement supervisors who are committed and who value candidates can participate in taking them on. A review of the FLM Placement Training Agreement should explicitly address how reflective engagement between learning and practice will take place/be encouraged.

#### **Recommendation 19**

That St Padarn's continue to develop the placement process, looking at the selection and induction of placement supervisors and the links between learning and practice built into the FLM placement training agreement.

# **Recommendation 20**

That St Padarn's articulate more clearly to PT FLM candidates how Theology for Life is formative, more than 'mere' theological learning.

# **Section E: Ministerial Formation**

- E1 The TEI's programme of ministerial formation enables students to grow into the ministerial qualities and competencies sought by the sponsoring church.
- 139. The Strategic Direction 2022-2028 reinforces the St Padarn's strapline of 'Formation in Community for Mission' and says that: 'This strapline expresses our core belief that all theological education, training and ministerial development is fundamentally a process of formation into the image of Christ. We believe that community and relationship are central to this process and central to the Church's mission we do not live, learn, grow, or minister as lone individuals. It is that mission which must shape what we do St. Padarn's does not exist for its own sake.' This thread of obedience to God's mission through the Church they serve was evident through the different dimensions of the review, from documentation to interviews and in worship.
- 140. The Strategic Direction document identifies six key themes, arising from a process of listening to the Governing Body, Bench of Bishops, varied provincial and diocesan strategic bodies and clergy and laity. These six themes are designed to shape St. Padarn's in the coming years with a resolute intention to look forward with hope. First, forming lay and ordained ministers who have a depth of spiritual life and can nurture spiritual growth in others, which should in turn overspill into communities which are 'deeply-rooted in God through the disciplines of prayer, bible-reading, eucharist and spiritual reflection' to grow in holiness and have strength to meet times of difficulty.
- 141. Second, numerical growth with a church that is 'bold, hopeful and outward looking, presenting the gospel and kingdom in ways which are attractive, with energy and momentum'. This requires all ministers to have skills in pioneering and an evangelistic outlook. The document notes that: 'Many will be called to have a role in the revitalising or planting of congregations.'
- 142. Third, the church should strive for the common good, forming constructive partnerships in communities in areas such as the environment, social justice and education.
- 143. Fourth, lay and ordained leadership is needed with ministers who are: '...creative and inspiring, resilient, secure in themselves and their calling from God, adaptable and possess high levels of people skills. Teamworking needs to be at the heart of the church. We need to invest in leaders, ensuring ongoing professional development.'
- 144. Fifth, the Church in Wales needs 'diversity in its ministers and in its approaches to ministry'. It clearly identifies needs related to Welsh language and culture, alongside diversity in terms of age, ethnicity, educational background and inclusion of those from areas of deprivation.
- 145. Finally, the strategy identifies the need for insight and for a church that can '…interpret the times, seeing clearly and responding astutely to the changing cultures and contexts.'
- 146. Significantly, these are not seen as themes that simply map onto programmes within St Padarn's, but rather seek to set the direction and culture for the whole of the Institute and which are then worked out in the shape and content of programmes.

- 147. The Church in Wales's Formative Expectations for Licensed Ministry set down clear expectations for ministerial formation under the heading of: Confidence, Security and Mature Faith; Team Working; Creative, Flexible and Adaptable; Grounded in Anglican Ecclesiology and Spirituality; Missional and Committed to Growth; and Strategic Leaders and Guides.
- 148. Each criterion is the theme of a weekend residential on the FLM programme every two years with explicit focus in at least two of the keynote sessions and is clearly reflected in preparatory and follow-up work. These weekends are attended by both full and part time candidates, though a few candidates on shorter bespoke pathways may not have the opportunity to attend every weekend. Candidates on the NLM programme also have regular residentials. For the first session on the FLM Cwmbran residential weekend reviewers attended, candidates were allocated to tables to ensure a good mix of full and part timers worked together. It was a credit to the maturity of the student body that for the rest of the residential the two pathways mixed without having to be prompted by staff; this is a training institution that does not infantilise its candidates but encourages collaboration and mutual support.
- 149. The PER mapping document clearly identifies where each of the six criteria is addressed, including teaching sessions, tasks and assignments, worship groups, interactions with fellow candidates during sessions and in formation cells, formation meetings with tutors and placements.
- 150. As noted in section A, the reviewers felt that the lack of specificity about a rich diversity of lay and ordained ministries and theological tradition has had some impact on the effectiveness of training and formation in enabling candidates to meet these formational outcomes. In terms of forming ministers as leaders, we heard from those in NLM and bishops and stakeholders that there perhaps needs to be further work done on preparing candidates to exercise episcope in leadership roles within ministry areas, which has not yet received adequate consideration in the move away from the parish system following implementation of the Harries report. However, this is made more complex by the dioceses having different understandings of ministry areas and the exact form of leadership roles required, so there is a need for greater clarity in what forms of ministerial leadership St. Padarn's is being asked to prepare candidates for.
- 151. It was also felt that there could be a stronger emphasis on continuing discernment of calling as part of the culture of ongoing development and the call to be alert to the current and future needs of the church and wider society. The reviewers found that the positivity of the current candidates FLM body was not as evident in the NLM body or in past candidates and some stakeholders. This highlights an area where ongoing development of the relationship between St Padarn's staff and diocesan staff is key, including further reflection on how to hone effective collaborative working and balancing provincial and diocesan areas of responsibility.

# **Commendation 14**

St Padarn's is commended for its positive, missional and evangelistic culture and ethos, which seeks to respond to the current and future needs of the Church in Wales.

That St Padarn's work with the Bench of Bishops to continue to hone the theological and ministerial formation of candidates to exercise appropriate leadership, and the exercise of episcope within the complexities of ministry areas in each diocese.

152. Staff at St Padarn's know their candidates well and do their best to encourage and challenge them, as appropriate. The structure of mixed mode training means that every candidate spends a significant percentage of training undertaking a parish placement, with the support and oversight of a parish supervisor. As with learning group facilitators, we heard from a number of present and past students about the varying quality of these means of support. St Padarn's recognise 'the extra challenge this gives to quality assurance' and in the past year the appointment of the Convenor of the Pioneer Community and Tutor in Contextual Learning has led to earlier identification of placement issues and a building up of relationships with diocesan teams and clergy.

#### **Recommendation 22**

That there should be further development of the relationships between St Padarn's and dioceses in relation to the selection, ongoing support and oversight of supervisors and facilitators.

- E2 Students have a desire and growing ability to share in mission, evangelism and discipleship.
- 153. As already noted, St Padarn's has mission and evangelism as a thread running through the institution. There is strong focus on forming lay and ordained ministers who are world-facing: 'Growth and development in individuals and in our churches is our goal.'
- 154. The reviewers found candidates who were thirsty for growth in themselves and others and who clearly support and encourage one another in these endeavours, for example, after the weekly Eucharist on a Wednesday, candidates are encouraged to share their 'good news' stories. We heard candidates speak with a passion for mission and who were empowered and encouraged to take good risks in trying new initiatives for the sake of the Missio Dei.
- 155. St Padarn's seeks to encourage all candidates to be pioneering in ways that are appropriate to their ministry and context. On the FLM residential we observed an interesting and challenging session where candidates were exploring the relationship between pioneering and Welsh culture.
- 156. All candidates are asked to complete an evangelism project during training, which could be anything from running the Alpha Course to starting a new service aimed at a specific group of people. Teaching sessions at residentials and resources aim to support the candidates in this and assessment on this is included in each candidate's report to their bishop. Some part-time candidates commented that they struggled to set aside adequate time for the project alongside other commitments.

#### **Commendation 15**

The Principal of St Padarn's models for staff and candidates an entrepreneurial approach to ministry and mission.

- 157. In the past four years, the Holy Trinity Brompton (HTB) network have been invited by diocesan bishops to initiate two church plants within the Church in Wales (Hope Street in Wrexham, Diocese of St. Asaph; Citizen Church in Cardiff, Diocese of Llandaff) as a means of spearheading missional growth. The ordinands from these resource churches were fully engaged with the training and spoke about how they benefited from the training alongside the diverse student body. An ordinand from Citizen Church is currently senior student at St Padarn's.
- 158. However, there seems to be some tension surrounding the balance of time between St Padarn's days and placement days, with placement supervisors sometimes expecting candidates to spend additional time in the placement. Whilst candidates from resource churches spoke warmly about their FLM training, they were clear that it was not specialist enough to prepare them for their expected future ministry leading a plant. However, the bishops have asked for them not to be treated differently and it might become more pertinent to explore this further in the NLM stage. With such a diverse student body as St Padarn's, it is inevitable that sometimes candidates will feel they have not engaged with a subject in adequate depth.
- 159. The Strategic Direction document recognises the need for further development in this area, noting that: '...many dioceses are seeking a renewed investment in this area and a step-change in their engagement in church planting, revitalisation and reimagining church.'
- 160. As noted in Criterion A, the Church in Wales does not currently have a clear strategy for calling out vocations.

#### **Recommendation 23**

That the Bench of Bishops clarifies whether it wishes candidates from the resource churches to have a distinctive form of FLM or NLM training to prepare candidates for their future ministry.

# E3 Pioneer ministry training

161. The Church in Wales does not designate people as pioneer ministers at discernment although, as noted above, there is a significant pioneer strand in all its training.

# E4 Students are growing in personal spirituality and engagement with public worship.

- 162. There is a clear sense of worship being central to Christian life and calling and to the community life of St Padarn's. There is encouragement to experience different styles and traditions of worship to enable them to minister in a variety of contexts in the future, reflecting an emphasis on the call to public ministry. Whilst reasonably diverse, hymns and songs did not include the contemporary Christian music commonly used in church planting contexts.
- 163. There is encouragement to experience different liturgical forms and ritual, which candidates clearly valued and saw as formational in developing their ability to plan and lead worship in

differing contexts. However, it would be helpful to engage further with breadth of diversity and belief, through relating more explicitly the theology, ecclesiology and missiology that sits behind a particular form of worship or ritual (the principle of lex orandi, lex credendi) in order that candidates can authentically inhabit a different tradition with integrity, including when theological conscience might mean they feel unable to undertake certain liturgical practices.

- 164. The Worship Handbook includes some basic principles and guidelines for candidates in relation to planning and leading worship. In response to the danger of constant creativity, from the current academic year there has been an expectation that Morning Prayer in the college chapel on Thursdays and Fridays always follows the standard format of the Church in Wales's 2009 Daily Prayer. The Worship Handbook says that doing this: '...allows us to gain from the continuous reading of scripture which the lectionary provides us across the week and across the weeks' and in addition allows candidates: '...to grow in confidence in our use of the Church in Wales liturgy'. However, this is only two mornings a week, and, in many cases, there seemed to be little link with their individual daily discipline of prayer or what happened corporately in their placement parishes. Again, much is dependent on the placement supervisor and context.
- 165. Whilst the annual self-assessment report and Formation Criteria reference the Spirituality and Worship criteria, placement Training Agreements do not include clear expectations round the essential need to form a secure pattern/rhythm of daily prayer to underpin their ministry. Those in NLM spoke of issues surrounding resilience in relation to their spiritual life, suggesting this is an area requiring further development.

#### **Commendation 16**

The recent change in practice to require the daily use of Church in Wales Morning Prayer liturgy during the weekly Cardiff onsite programme brings a greater coherence to the varied pattern of worship, which otherwise offers good opportunity for experimentation and exploration.

#### **Recommendation 24**

That the Bench of Bishops sets clear expectations around the daily disciplines of prayer for candidates and St Padarn's incorporates this into its teaching, worship planning, placement agreements and reports.

- 166. The community of St Padarn's is clearly one where candidates and staff hold one another in prayer, though we heard mixed reflections about the effectiveness of prayer groups during residentials and about the inconsistency of formation cells. Some cell groups were highly effective and met regularly, but others had not met for significant periods of time.
- 167. We observed some very good teaching sessions from the Tutor in Mission and Preaching. Whilst candidates for a preaching ministry are expected to preach at least five times a year and receive feedback within the placement context, some candidates spoke of preaching much more often and said that they would appreciate more opportunities for practical training in college sessions throughout the programme (current taught input is largely built into the beginning and end of FLM training).

# E5 Students' personality, character and relationships

- 168. St Padarn's strong sense of being formed in community in relation to the needs of the Church and world leads to both staff and candidates being open, flexible and willing to learn and grow.

  Candidates were articulate in recognising their own strengths and weakness.
- 169. The staff are very pastorally supportive and approachable not only for the candidates, but also other members of the staff team. It has been beneficial for the Director of Formation to live on-site at Llandaff as a constant pastoral presence. His wife is Coordinator for Partner Support and there was certainly a good degree of recognition of the demands of training on families. In addition, families can contact a clergy spouse who is by profession an occupational therapist dealing with mental health through major life changes.

#### **Commendation 17**

# St Padarn's models effectively a pastorally supportive community.

170. There was feedback during some interviews concerning how candidates experienced the progression from FLM to NLM, with some saying they did not feel fully prepared for the reality of ministry. The reasons for this are complex, but the lack of clarity about different ministries in terms of 'being' and 'doing' (referred to at section A) is pertinent here, and also a lack of parity in terms of ongoing support within dioceses.

#### **Recommendation 25**

That the Bench of Bishops with St Padarn's and relevant diocesan officers works on how appropriate forms of support can be given through the transition from FLM to NLM and ongoing into the development of ministry.

- E6 Students are developing in the dispositions and skills of leadership, collaboration and ability to work in community.
- 171. These skills and dispositions are addressed through the teaching curriculum and in residentials, but there is also a continuous encouragement within St. Padarn's to work collaboratively with other candidates. However, it highlights again the need for further nuancing between different lay and ordained ministries to enable candidates to fully inhabit and grow into the ministries to which they have been called.
- 172. Reviewers were aware of the report Representation of Women in the Church in Wales, produced by a working group chaired by Gill Todd in 2015, established by the Governing Body's standing committee to review representation of women and which came after similar reviews in 2008 and 2011. The reviewers' experience points to evidence that elements of this are working, but that it needs further clarification and to be discussed with candidates as part of developing their understanding of issues of authority, responsibility and power dynamics and as part of gaining resilience to sustain future ministry. In interviews with training incumbents and those in the FLM, NLM periods and beyond, the reviewers heard anecdotal evidence several times of bullying or sexual harassment in parishes (but not in St. Padarn's), particularly for female candidates and

- sometimes by a TI or placement supervisor. This suggests that issues raised in Todd's report might still be pertinent and need to be kept under review and incidents robustly investigated within dioceses. St. Padarn's staff are responsive when any issue is reported to them.
- 173. The Strategic Direction 2022-2028 identifies the need in this next phase of St Padarn's development to: '...work under the Ministry Bishop to devise and implement appropriate ways of creating a culture of high-level professional development and opportunities for the growth of the character and competencies needed for strategic roles in our mission and common life.' This requires some culture change and practical change in where investment in the Church in Wales is focused i.e., currently investment in training and development is frontloaded on pre-licensing, with less on the NLM period and even less for ongoing ministry and in addition, it requires significant engagement from each diocese.

That the Bench of Bishops works with St Padarn's and diocesan officers to ensure training incumbents and placement supervisors are carefully chosen and trained and that any accusations of bullying or sexual harassment are dealt with appropriately and effectively, in the light of the Whistleblowing Guidance in the Provincial Safeguarding Policy.

- E7 Students' sense of calling to ministry within the sponsoring church is growing, realistic and informed.
- 174. Candidates expressed their own sense of being called by God to ministry clearly and with excitement and due humility. They demonstrated a strong commitment to the Church in Wales, but not always a clear understanding or sense of God's initial or ongoing call through his Church (see section A).
- 175. The creation of ministry areas requires clergy to be able to work with integrity across a breadth of theological traditions and in diverse contexts. Alongside their parish placement in FLM, candidates are able and encouraged to undertake diverse placement experiences e.g., in schools and chaplaincies.
- E8 The TEI has sound procedures for the interim and end-of-training assessment of students' knowledge, skills and dispositions, reporting on their achievement and identifying further learning needs for the next stages of training and ministry.
- 176. An important aspect of formation at St Padarn's are the regular meetings candidates have at least once a term with their personal tutor. The FLM handbook says: 'these meetings are intended on being challenging, honest and supportive and a key forum for your development and growth.'

  The student body is small enough for tutors to know their candidates well, something evident in our interviews and times of observation.
- 177. The Record of Formation Proforma does not currently correspond to the Formational Expectations, and we would recommend these are updated for the purpose of clarity and included in the FLM handbook.

- 178. St Padarn's Principal and Dean for Initial Ministerial Training have six-monthly candidate's meetings with each diocesan bishop. These draw on a candidate's engagement with teaching and community life as well as the formation meetings with personal tutors.
- 179. A formal report for every candidate is sent to their bishop during the final year of training. This report draws in evidence from engagement with the teaching programme and community life, formation meetings with their personal tutor, reports from a placement supervisor and cell guide. Candidates are also expected to write a self-reflection on their formational growth.
- 180. Occasionally, a bishop might request a special report on a candidate or under certain circumstances, St Padarn's might decide to send a bishop a special report, e.g., if there are formation or pastoral concerns about a candidate.
- 181. All reports are done 'with' candidates to aid their formational growth, emphasise personal responsibility for formation and to give opportunities to suggest corrections or points of clarification.
- 182. Training supervisors are given a copy of the final year report before licensing as a matter of course, though some said it would also be helpful for the candidate's selection report to be shared with them. There appeared to be less consistency and rigour about how assessment against the formative expectations takes place during the NLM period. Some evidence suggested training supervisors did not always feel they had adequate input into this assessment. The NLM handbook includes expectations and possible evidence for formational development.
- 183. Right through initial discernment and FLM and NLM, the primary focus is rightly on issues of formation (being). However, several candidates at different stages of formation and training referred to their lack of understanding about the exact nature of the ministry to which they had been selected for (see A2) and how they might appropriately and effectively exercise this through ministerial tasks (doing). Reviewers are not suggesting a change to a checklist model of training, but consideration of whether it would be helpful to undertake a mapping exercise that tracks expectations about specific tasks which those in a particular ministry will need to focus on and gain competence in (doing).

As part of the wider strategic recommended clarification about particular forms of lay and ordained ministry, that St. Padarn's review whether undertaking a mapping exercise about specific tasks would bring greater clarity and parity for candidates across the Church in Wales.

# **Summary of Commendations**

#### **Commendation 1**

St Padarn's is a collaborative community of formation with God's mission at the fore and an infectious zeal for the Gospel. All candidates are encouraged and expected to be pioneering in their approach to ministry and mission.

#### **Commendation 2**

The Principal and staff have a clear and deliberate focus on building strong relationships with members of the Executive Board, Bishops and key stakeholders.

#### **Commendation 3**

The strategic aims surrounding engagement with Welsh language and culture are clearly effective within the staff and student bodies at St Padarn's.

#### **Commendation 4**

The new ecumenical apprenticeship framework is an imaginative and outward looking way of seeking to foster widening participation and diversity within the Church in Wales.

#### **Commendation 5**

St Padarn's has a stable and strong network of external/partner relationships, which can support rigorous learning and meaningful staff development.

#### **Commendation 6**

St Padarn's are commended for their effective collaboration with external bodies via partnerships in relation to NWfAC and chaplaincy.

#### **Commendation 7**

St Padarn's has a strong and attractive team ethos, building a culture which demonstrates a true valuing of individuals. Staff live out and model this culture exceptionally well.

#### **Commendation 8**

St Padarn's staff are particularly effective at modelling appropriate patterns of spirituality, learning and reflection.

# **Commendation 9**

St Padarn's complex yet clear oversight structures embed the Institute in key wider oversight and accountability structures of the Church in Wales alongside those of partner academic institutions. St Padarn's maintain what appear to be excellent partnerships with validating Universities.

#### **Commendation 10**

St Padarn's has clear, robust and effective business planning and financial processes with very good risk management, embedded in the overarching RB Risk Register.

# **Commendation 11**

St Padarn's offers a diverse range of academic programmes, including the provision of specialist MA programmes.

#### **Commendation 12**

The learning support given by St. Padarn's staff to candidatess with a range of complex needs is excellent.

### **Commendation 13**

St. Padarn's are commended for the ways in which they seek to listen and respond to the student voice.

#### **Commendation 14**

St Padarn's is commended for its positive, missional and evangelistic culture and ethos, which seeks to respond to the current and future needs of the Church in Wales.

#### **Commendation 15**

The Principal of St Padarn's models for staff and candidatess an entrepreneurial approach to ministry and mission.

#### **Commendation 16**

The recent change in practice to require the daily use of Church in Wales Morning Prayer liturgy during the weekly Cardiff onsite programme brings a greater coherence to the varied pattern of worship, which otherwise offers good opportunity for experimentation and exploration.

#### **Commendation 17**

St Padarn's models effectively a pastorally supportive community.

# **Summary of Wider Strategic Recommendations**

# Wider Strategic Recommendation 1

That the Director of Ministry Development, Bench of Bishops and appropriate others undertake further work on effective communication with St Padarn's, ensuring their work is firmly embedded and understood within the wider vision of the Church in Wales and its individual dioceses.

# **Wider Strategic Recommendation 2**

That the Bench of Bishops articulate more clearly the different forms of ordained and lay ministry, including a nuanced understanding of different forms of lay ministry and considering what can appropriately be agreed provincially and what should be agreed or nuanced at a diocesan level.

# **Wider Strategic Recommendation 3**

That the Bench of Bishops work with the Director of Ministry Development to develop a vocations strategy that ties in clearly with workforce planning in the coming years and consider how the provincial discernment and selection process might be re-shaped to ensure the Church is calling the candidates it needs and to train the ministers it requires to enable mission and evangelism.

# **Wider Strategic Recommendation 4**

That the Bench of Bishops initiate work on the challenges and opportunities of theological breadth within the Church in Wales, including issues of Anglican ecclesiology, missiology, worship and spirituality and then give clear direction to the staff at St Padarn's about the impact of this on training and formation.

# **Summary of Other Recommendations**

#### **Recommendation 1**

That St Padarn's staff continue to develop their collaborative working with the Bench of Bishops and individual dioceses to form effective partnerships in the light of ongoing formation, development and discernment of calling to meet the needs of God's mission.

#### **Recommendation 2**

That St Padarn's staff identify appropriate and constructive opportunities for debate and discussion between those from different theological traditions.

#### **Recommendation 3**

That the Bench of Bishops might consider the identification of potential theological educators through the discernment and selection process to encourage the raising up of Welsh theologians.

#### **Recommendation 4**

That St Padarn's undertake further discussion with the Bench of Bishops about the possibility of identifying and resourcing additional training pathways that might be more accessible to some potential candidates.

#### **Recommendation 5**

That St Padarn's explore occasional possibilities for PT candidates to gain from/participate in some of the specific FT programme.

#### **Recommendation 6**

That St Padarn's continue to evaluate whether a weekly 48-hour gathering is the best fit for delivering the desired FT FLM outcomes, or whether other patterns of meeting (e.g. for longer periods, less often) might be viable alternatives.

#### **Recommendation 7**

That St Padarn's maintain the recent focus on development and support of Formational Cell Guides and offer clearer articulation, especially to PT candidates, of the purpose and value of Formational Cells, to ensure all candidates value this element of the model.

# **Recommendation 8**

St Padarn's and its diocesan partners should consider intentionally extending diocesan support initiatives (e.g. for clergy spouses) to include spouses and partners of those in training at St Padarn's. This would have the benefit of making the connections across the college community whilst being more geographically alert and accessible.

That St Padarn's explore possibilities for enhancing the worship space, either through re-ordering of the chapel for flexibility, or using other spaces as appropriate.

#### **Recommendation 10**

That St Padarn's explore opportunities to create more of a sense of 'space' within the residential programme, including attention to the physical environment for worship and potential for the facility for learners to 'retreat' or reflect throughout the programme.

#### **Recommendation 11**

That the Chief Executive of the RB and Ministry Bishop, who will both line-manage the Director of Ministry Development, consider ways in which the effectiveness of the new role can be assessed, particularly in relation to further development of the strategic dimension of the work of St Padarn's.

#### **Recommendation 12**

That the Chief Executive of the RB and Bench of Bishops, in partnership with St Padarn's agree a clear process for developing, agreeing and monitoring strategic direction.

#### **Recommendation 13**

That, after due discussion and any required adjustments, the Bench of Bishops formally agrees the strategic direction of St Padarn's for the coming six years.

#### **Recommendation 14**

That St Padarn's look to develop a research policy to enable staff and candidates development and ensure further development of a research culture.

#### **Recommendation 15**

Given the very strong PG taught programme on offer, and the fact that staff are qualified and are already supervising research degrees, that St Padarn's consider launching a validated PG research degree programme.

#### **Recommendation 16**

That St. Padarn's reviews opportunities for learning biblical languages, including the structure and format of teaching and learning.

#### **Recommendation 17**

That St Padarn's give further consideration to the support, review and feedback process for learning group facilitators.

That St. Padarn's considers some diversification of forms of assignment to encourage the skills of theological reflection and reflective practice and enabling further ministerial formation.

#### **Recommendation 19**

That St Padarn's continue to develop the placement process, looking at the selection and induction of placement supervisors and the links between learning and practice built into the FLM placement training agreement.

#### **Recommendation 20**

That St Padarn's articulate more clearly to PT FLM candidates how Theology for Life is formative, more than 'mere' theological learning.

#### **Recommendation 21**

That St Padarn's work with the Bench of Bishops to continue to hone the theological and ministerial formation of candidates to exercise appropriate leadership, and the exercise of episcope within the complexities of ministry areas in each diocese.

#### **Recommendation 22**

That there should be further development of the relationships between St Padarn's and dioceses in relation to the selection, ongoing support and oversight of supervisors and facilitators.

#### **Recommendation 23**

That the Bench of Bishops clarifies whether it wishes candidates from the resource churches to have a distinctive form of FLM or NLM training to prepare candidates for their future ministry.

#### **Recommendation 24**

That the Bench of Bishops sets clear expectations around the daily disciplines of prayer for candidates and St Padarn's incorporates this into its teaching, worship planning, placement agreements and reports.

#### **Recommendation 25**

That the Bench of Bishops with St Padarn's and relevant diocesan officers works on how appropriate forms of support can be given through the transition from FLM to NLM and ongoing into the development of ministry.

#### **Recommendation 26**

That the Bench of Bishops works with St Padarn's and diocesan officers to ensure training incumbents and placement supervisors are carefully chosen and trained and that any accusations of bullying or sexual harassment are dealt with appropriately and effectively, in the light of the Whistleblowing Guidance in the Provincial Safeguarding Policy.

As part of the wider strategic recommended clarification about particular forms of lay and ordained ministry, that St. Padarn's review whether undertaking a mapping exercise about specific tasks would bring greater clarity and parity for candidates across the Church in Wales.