

# **Ministry Council**

# Periodic External Review Report

The College of the Resurrection, Mirfield

November 2015- March 2016

Ministry Division Church House Great Smith Street London SW1P 3AZ Tel: 020 7898 1412 Fax: 020 7898 1421

Published 2016 by the Ministry Division of the Archbishops' Council Copyright © The Archbishops' Council 2016

### CONTENTS

GLOSS	ARY	1
LIST OF	FREVIEWERS	2
THE PE	RIODIC EXTERNAL REVIEW FRAMEWORK	3
SUMMA	\RY	4
FULL R	EPORT	7
SECT	TION ONE: AIMS AND KEY RELATIONS	9
А	Aims and objectives	9
В	Relationships with other institutions	11
SECT	TION TWO: CURRICULUM FOR FORMATION AND EDUCATION	14
С	Curriculum for formation and education	14
SECT	TION THREE: MINISTERIAL DEVELOPMENT	16
D	Community and corporate life	16
Е	Worship and training in public worship	
F	Ministerial, personal and spiritual formation	22
SECTION FOUR: EDUCATION AND TRAINING		32
G	Teaching and learning: content, method and resources	32
Н	Practical and pastoral theology	35
SECT	FION FIVE: STAFF AND STUDENTS	39
I	Teaching staff	39
J	All staff	39
K	Students	40
SECT	FION SIX: GOVERNANCE, MANAGEMENT AND FINANCE	42
L	Organisation and governance	42
М	Business planning and risk management	46
Ν	Financial policies	49
0	Statutory and operating policies	51
Р	Accommodation	51
CON	CLUSION	52
LIST OF	F RECOMMENDATIONS	53

### GLOSSARY

BAP	Bishops' Advisory Panel
CoR	Community of the Resurrection
DDO	Diocesan Director of Ordinands
TR	Theological Reflection
YMC	Yorkshire Ministry Course

### LIST OF REVIEWERS

The Venerable Dr Brian Russell, Senior Reviewer, Senior Chaplain, the Anglican Chaplaincy in Norway, Diocese in Europe

**The Rev'd Canon Dr Robin Greenwood**, Visiting fellow, St John's College, Durham; writer on mission and ministry

**Sir Stephen Lander**, formerly Director General of MI5 and Chair of the Serious Organised Crime Agency

Dr Margaret Masson, Principal of St Chad's College, Durham

### THE PERIODIC EXTERNAL REVIEW FRAMEWORK

On behalf of the sponsoring churches, review teams are asked to assess the fitness for purpose of the training institution for preparing candidates for ordained and licensed ministry and to make recommendations for the enhancement of the life and work of the institution.

Within the structures of the Church of England, this report has been prepared for the House of Bishops acting through the Ministry Council.

In coming to their judgements, reviewers are asked to use the following outcomes with regard to the overall outcome and individual criteria:

### Confidence

Overall outcome: a number of recommendations, none of which question the generally high standards found in the review.

Criteria level: aspects of an institution's life which show good or best practice.

### **Confidence with qualifications**

Overall outcome: A number of recommendations, including one or more of substance that questions the generally acceptable standards found in the review and which can be rectified or substantially addressed by the institution in the coming 12 months.

Criteria level: aspects of an institution's life which show either (a) at least satisfactory practice but with some parts which are not satisfactory or (b) some unsatisfactory practice but where the institution has the capacity to address the issues within 12 months.

### No confidence

Overall outcome: A number of recommendations, including one or more of substance which raise significant questions about the standards found in the review and the capacity of the institution to rectify or substantially address these in the coming 12 months.

Criteria level: aspects of an institution's life which show either (a) generally not satisfactory practice or (b) some unsatisfactory practice where it is not evident that the institution can rectify the issues within the coming 12 months.

### THE REPORT OF THE PERIODIC EXTERNAL REVIEW OF THE COLLEGE OF THE RESURRECTION, MIRFIELD

#### November 2015 – March 2016

#### SUMMARY

#### Introduction

The College has an exemplary history of holding together Catholic Anglican spiritual discipline and patterns of worship with a robust intellectual theology. All this has been based on a commitment to social justice with ministry seen as costly service in parishes and places of social need. In this new era, the College brings together men and women training for ordained ministry, from a wide range of approaches and traditions within the Church of England. There are currently 32 ordinands in training, eight of whom are women, and this increase in numbers has also brought with it a stronger financial basis for the College. A high proportion of students are graduates studying for degrees or postgraduate degrees in theology.

As Reviewers, we have been impressed by the openness, enthusiasm and positive goodwill of the ordinands in training, especially in their commitment to future ministry. We have also been impressed by the quality of the residential staff as good models in their teaching and tutorial work. The staff engage in mature ways with adult learners.

The College had made significant steps forward in the period of time since the last Review of 2011:

I. Pastoral training and formation has been developed further, and greater integration made with academic learning.

2. There is a consolidated and secure basis for ministerial formation which is proving for the most part effective for future ministry, as evidenced by our wide consultations with former students, training incumbents and others.

3. There is greater cohesion in community life.

4 The College had continued to look outward in seeking to create and sustain partnerships in changing circumstances (as outlined below in Relationships).

5. The College attracts ordinands, both men and women, from a wide range of traditions and approaches within the Church of England, including from evangelical and central traditions. This gives a variety of outlooks amongst the ordinands and they were ready to explain that their choice of the College of the Resurrection was guided by finding at the College what they recognised they needed with regard to ministerial formation and theological training.

Taken together, these points highlight the current strengths of the College.

This positive picture we formed of the College suggests that there are impressions and expectations at large in the Church of England that reflect more stereotypical views of the College and we consider these to be out of date compared to what we found. This outdated view may unnecessarily deter some ordinands from visiting or considering the college when they would in fact gain considerably from what is offered at the College. Indeed, a number of current ordinands mentioned that they had met questions over their choice of the College when they first made the decision; all those who said this were convinced that they had been right to make the College of the Resurrection their first choice.

### Summary of outcomes

The Review team has confidence in regarding the College of the Resurrection, Mirfield, as fit for the purpose for preparing candidates for ordained ministry.

CRITERIA	OUTCOME
A. Aims, objectives and evaluation of the institution	Confidence
B Relationships with other institutions	Confidence
C Curriculum for formation and education	Confidence
D Community and corporate life	Confidence
E Worship and training in public worship	Confidence with
	qualifications
F Ministerial, personal and spiritual formation	Confidence
G Teaching and learning: content, method and resources	Confidence
H Practical and pastoral theology	Confidence
I Teaching staff	Confidence
J All staff	Confidence
K Students	Confidence
L Governance, management, constitution and	Confidence with
organisation	qualifications
M Business planning and risk management	Confidence with
	qualifications
N Financial policies and cost-effectiveness	Confidence
O Reserves policy and statutory liabilities	Confidence
P Accommodation	Confidence
Overall Outcome	Confidence

### **General observations**

The Report is written in relation to the Criteria set out in the *Quality Assurance and Enhancement in Ministerial Formation* Handbook October 2014. The paragraphs follow the Criteria which are printed in *italic* type. The reviewers' comments are in normal type and the recommendations in **bold**.

### Strengths

We particularly note the following areas of strength:

- Strong Catholic Anglican identity enriched by appeal to different traditions
- Embedded in life and rhythm of monastic Community of the Resurrection and daily round of prayer
- Handling diversity issues around gender well for the most part (but see also Areas for Attention)
- Strong academic partnership with Sheffield University a good complement in the CofE's training landscape to Durham/Common Awards and Oxbridge
- Committed high-calibre teaching staff
- Committed and enthusiastic students
- Practical relationship with CoR/Frere Trust with practical benefits in finance and maintenance

### Areas for attention

We note the following areas for attention:

- Need for some continued care over managing a diversity of views around ordained ministry and gender within the Community
- Need for more missional openness to innovative and creative worship styles
- Need for full and active Council ownership of strategic aims and direction, organised around ownership of new business plan
- Need to develop staff and student engagement within governance structures

### **FULL REPORT**

### INTRODUCTION

- 1. This Review was conducted over an expanded time span, at the request of the Principal and staff. The senior Reviewer made his initial visit on October 24th and 25th 2015, a visit which included sharing in Sunday worship. The team as a whole made residential visits between November 8th and 12th 2015 and between March 2nd and 4th 2016, the latter visit coinciding with a meeting of the College Council. This extended time span had an advantage because there are a number of areas in which external points of transition were having an impact on the College. Examples include a change of Principal and some staff on the Yorkshire Ministry Course, whose administrative base is at the College; the creation of a new diocese as the local diocese of the College; and a renewal of its university partnership arrangements. These matters are addressed in sections B and G
- 2. As part of the Review, the senior reviewer contacted a number of Bishops, including the chair of the College Council, the Principal and Vice Principal of the Yorkshire Ministry Course (YMC), and the Superior of the Community of the Resurrection. With the goodwill of the Principal, advice was also sought from a range of recent leavers who are now priests or deacons, as well as a range of placement supervisors, training incumbents and Diocesan Directors of Ordinands (DDOs). All these contacts and discussions have informed the Review.
- 3. We have already indicated that most of the recommendations of the last Review have been met fully. Further attention is needed in some areas. The previous Review identified that the way some decisions were taken in this complex institution were not fully explained or communicated. The Report pointed to the benefit that may come from a College Council that was more reflective of the current approach of the College, as well as the need to find ways in which students could play a more instrumental part in the life and decisions of the College. An important recommendation asked for a business or development plan that was specific in the actions to be taken by the College, adopted by the College Council, as distinct from being only part of the plan which belongs to the Community of the Resurrection. This review team were encouraged that the College Council adopted a College Plan at its March meeting in 2016 and the Council will

now need to monitor progress in line with this plan. We found, from conversations with ordinands, we could not easily form a picture of how ordinands are selected for positions of responsibility within the College. There is a good opportunity to ensure that the appointments of students represents fully the current breadth and diversity of the student body and so contributes to the cohesion of community life and enables all to make their respective contributions. We address this matter in section D on Community Life and sections L and M on Governance and Management.

- 4. There are a few matters from 2011 which require further consideration, including the 2011 recommendation regarding "innovative worship" (see section E below) and the need for regular appraisal and staff development of the administrative staff (see section J below).
- 5. The College accepts women ordinands for training, while seeking also to attract those, generally known as "traditionalists", who do not accept the ordination of women. It is a strength of the College that seeks to reflect the wider Church in bringing together a diverse student body in this way. This has, not surprisingly, produced tensions both in the student community and for the staff, and it would be a mistake to pretend that those tensions have not from time to time affected the formation of the students and working life of the academic staff. Whilst these difficulties reflect the tensions found in the Church at large, they can be experienced at Mirfield more intensely in what is in other respects a close knit and mutually supportive community. We understand that the College has made commendable efforts (and with some success) to manage these tensions, which have advanced or receded in the face of changing personalities and events. But it was clear to us, as it must be to the College, that further efforts in this regard are still required. The concerns of those who oppose the ordination of women must be openly respected, and their consequent needs accommodated. At the same time, there needs to be an acceptance of, and respect for, the priestly ministry of women in the Church of England and this cannot appear to be a matter of equivocation for the College itself. There is, therefore, a particular obligation on all those involved in the management, direction and control of the College from the Trustees, through to the Council and Principal to the staff, to do nothing that undermines that ministry for those women (and men in favour of women's ordination) who have chosen Mirfield for their ordination training. We comment further on this in section D ii.

### SECTION ONE: AIMS AND KEY RELATIONS

### A Aims and objectives

Reviewers will consider whether the institution's aims are appropriate, clearly articulated and understood.

- A.i Its aims, objectives and policies should be appropriate to the preparation of students for ordained/lay public ministry within the breadth of the traditions of the sponsoring church.
- 6. From the papers provided for the review, and from our observations, we confirm that the aims, objectives and policies are appropriate to the preparation of ordinands for ministry within the breadth of the Church of England. Given the changing mission situation in England and the fact that the College has in recent years attracted ordinands from a wide range of traditions within the Church of England, there are some matters of practice where we recommend and encourage some developments or adjustments to better match the current body of ordinands, including with regard to preaching, worship and mission.
- 7. The College has a strong emphasis upon mission, with good provision for worship and preaching, which follows from a model of mission and evangelism through the church. This is a particular strength. At the same time, the Formation Criteria for Ordained Ministry give a wider focus to this concern for Mission, Evangelism and Discipleship. They speak of engaging in mission, evangelism and apologetics, and communicating the gospel sensitively and appropriately, both through the church and also in contexts which are explicitly "outside the church". The new College Plan responds to this with an objective (Objective 3) which seeks "to provide the wider Church with ordained men and women of maturity who will become resilient, faithful and mission-focussed priests (in whatever capacity they are called to serve) and witness to God's love." This is much to be welcomed as an objective and it describes a challenge for the whole Church of England in equipping clergy for mission "outside the church". We consider that more is needed to fulfil this objective and sections E on Worship and F on Mission pick up this point. The staff of the College are already stretched but the staff of the Yorkshire Ministry Course could be asked to assist with regard to preparation for mission "outside the church" and this is referred to in section B on relationships.

- Aii. They should be consistent with the current published policy statement of the sponsoring church.
- 8. Given the points made in Ai, the aims, objectives and policies are consistent with the current published policy statements of the Church of England. In papers prepared for the review, the Principal speaks of the College at the present time as "confident, seriously questioning, eager to meet challenges and deeply grateful for the wisdom and generosity of the past". We endorse this.
- A iii. The institution should show that it has built on earlier learning, including through action is response to the following, and that it has an effective culture of self-evaluation:
  - Previous PER, curriculum approval and follow-up reports;
  - other external bodies' evaluation, eg Quality Assurance Agency reports; and
  - self-evaluations
- 9. We are confident that the College has a healthy culture of self-evaluation and this has underpinned the significant developments made since the last Review in 2011 as described above. However, the annual selfmonitoring reports, required by the Ministry Division, seen by the reviewers were not completed as comprehensively as could be the case, appearing uneven, with insufficient evidence such that they do not identify the progress made in any detail. This gave a misleading impression of complacency and hinted at a lack of engagement. We encourage more enthusiasm in keeping review documents so that the documents give a comprehensive picture of the actual self-examination that is to be found in the development of the programme for formation and training.

The review team has Confidence with regard to Criterion A, Aims and objectives of the Institution.

### **B** Relationships with other institutions

Reviewers will look at how well the institution engages with partners:

- B.i There should be evidence of the institution's commitment to partnership with the other providers of theological education in the region.
- 10. In recent years, the College has made great efforts to be in partnership with other providers of theological education in the region. The College participated in the development, at the Community's initiative, of the Mirfield Centre, and provided the base for the then School of Ministry (Wakefield), which met the diocesan training needs for training Readers and pastoral ministers. The College has had appropriate links with the Yorkshire Ministry Course (founded 2008), whose administrative base is at the Mirfield campus, through some shared opportunities for planning worship. The College is a member of the Regional Training Partnership and open to links with the newly founded St Barnabas Theological Centre in the region. In terms of its own activities, the College has sought to diversify to a degree so as to fulfil its potential to be a theological and spiritual resource to the region. This includes the Mirfield Centre (for developing lay discipleship through theological teaching and opportunities for spiritual growth) and the establishment of its Mirfield Liturgical Institute which can promote both teaching and research in liturgical matters (see E2). This inevitably means that the College core and associate staff are very stretched in terms of the demands on their time.
- 11. However, very recent events have created external changes that are possibly going to impact on what the College has planned. A new diocese has been created for the region; and at this early stage in bringing the three Diocesan Schools on Ministry into a common framework, it is hard to know how the new Diocese will look upon the College as a theological resource for the diocese. The Diocese will need priests who can promote and develop the church and Discipleship amongst those who are not familiar with the Church and the Christian Faith. Additionally, the Yorkshire Ministry Course (YMC) has a new Principal, and some staff changes and will in future follow the Common Awards of Durham University rather than the curriculum of the Sheffield programme (see Bii). The YMC is likely to form closer links with the St Barnabas Theological centre. However, this need not preclude collaboration with the College.

- 12. The new College Plan, adopted by Council in March 2016, has as Objective 4 "To develop a responsible sharing of the theological resources" of the college", including with reference to the YMC. The Principal's written report to Council refers to this, speaking of the need to "go on seeking the right relationship between all of us on the site who contribute to the development of ministry and mission for the whole Church", adding that "we need to be sure that our combined resources are seen to be making an attractive, focussed and inspirational offer to those whom God is calling to ordained and lay ministry". The current relationship between the Course and the College is a-symmetrical. It is very valuable that the College and the Community contribute to YMC teaching on liturgy, church history and other areas. But the YMC currently makes a small contribution to the mission course of the College. With the YMC now having a full complement of staff, and the prospect of an additional member of staff to be appointed for the College, we consider it is the right moment to develop a greater sense of partnership and the sharing of staff resources between the Course and the College. We found that the Course was very open to forming a partnership of equals, drawing on their respective strengths and their availability to each other on the common site. This could enhance the training available to the region as a whole. For example, the YMC has expertise in mission amongst those on the fringe or outside the church, and were able to offer a study day recently on this for initial and continuing education that reflected the Five Marks of Mission. This could valuably complement what is offered at the College and assist in responding to the recommendation that is found in section F11, linking worship with preaching and mission.
- 13. There is also scope to extend student contacts between the YMC and the College, for example by making a more intentional use of those occasions when YMC students are present on the site. However, it is less easy to envisage greater cooperation with the Regional Training Partnership, which currently seems to be less significant in the region. The Yorkshire Theological Training Partnership has a vision and energy, as reported at College Council in March, and constitutes an ecumenical network for the region in providing the Durham Common Awards for diocesan training for Readers and for lay discipleship. This could link with the Mirfield Centre but the College itself will not be following the Durham Common Awards.

### **Recommendation 1**

We recommend that the College seeks to develop a greater partnership with the Yorkshire Ministry Course, especially in regard to sharing staff resources, with the aim of forming a secure framework for collaboration.

- B.ii The institution should draw fully on the resources of universities in teaching, quality assessment, staff development and the promotion of research.
- 14. At the time of the last Review, the college had a successful partnership with the then Department of Biblical Studies in the University of Sheffield. This has included provision for MA and BA degrees with teaching both at the College and through attendance at Sheffield. Whilst this arrangement came up for review in 2015, after the initial five year period, the good news was announced at the March College Council that a new agreement for the continuation of the partnership will be made for a further 3 to 5 years (see section G).
- B.iii It should engage effectively with other local churches, other faith communities and secular organisations so as to enhance formation for public ministry.
- 15. The programme of the College ensures that it engages effectively with local churches and agencies, through the arrangements for parish and institutional placements. There are opportunities to engage both ecumenically and in inter-faith issues. The College also maintains links with the wider church and world, for example in facilitating placements within the Anglican Communion.
- 16. The College and community also see themselves as having a local role in hosting occasions and community events and being "open" to local links and relationships in Mirfield.
- 17. With an anticipation of a good response to the recommendation made above, we have confidence with regard to this Criterion.

The review team has Confidence with regard to Criterion B, Relationships with other institutions.

# SECTION TWO: CURRICULUM FOR FORMATION AND EDUCATION

### C Curriculum for formation and education

Reviewers will consider the curriculum's design and content.

- C.i There should be a theological, formational and educational rationale for the institution's approach to mission and to formation for ministry and discipleship.
- 18. The review team consider this a particular strength. There is an integrated educational, theological and formational rationale for the institution's approach to formation for ministry and discipleship. These deep structures of formation and worship lay down reservoirs of discipline that provide an excellent and secure foundation for ministers. We were impressed by the way that the academic curriculum is integrated with pastoral placements and tutor's theological reflection and how this is all of a piece with community life, service and worship with good relationships with staff in the dining room and chapel as well as in teaching and learning. For example, the range of learning modules, either at university or on campus, are designed to help build up the students as mature human beings with professional competence as they prepare realistically for particular roles and responsibilities in the Church at a critical time for churches and leaders. The components of this formation include academic study in doctrine, liturgy, the Eucharist and the daily office, and Christian ethics. There are particular modules on Anglican history and liturgy integrated with reflection on ministerial practice. The taught module on Mission has been designed to connect students with the Church of England's formational criteria on Mission, Evangelism and Discipleship (see section H).
- C.ii The institution should offer, and periodically review, a set of programmes that will enable candidates to be prepared for their ministries and/or meet their learning needs.
- 19. The set of programmes is well designed and delivered, so enabling ordinands to be prepared for future ministries. There is good attention to individual learning needs. We found ample evidence of ongoing scrutiny, review and development and we have commented on the regular review of the programmes in section A.iii.

- C.iii The academic and formational assessment methods should enable the institution to advise church leaders on the suitability of candidates for their ministry.
- 20. The review team consider that the academic and formational assessment methods enable the College to advise the church leaders on the suitability of candidates for ministry. We found evidence of the assessment of theological reflection; the capacity to engage with theological and pastoral issues; the awareness of theological, cultural and historical contexts; and of regular practice of relating academic learning with pastoral and missiological learning. For example, the review team observed students who were free to participate, with enjoyment, in a tutor-led process making creative connections between scripture, God's Grace and mission in contemporary society. A cross section of written assignments demonstrated students' developing aptitude in relating scripture to doctrine, human sciences and practice. This is often passionate work, potentially of high calibre, matched by assiduous marking and gently challenging positive feedback from the staff (see also section F)., The overall impression was of students being accompanied in critiquing the Church and themselves in the work and preparing to share in God's mission in demanding times for faith and churches.

The review team has Confidence with regard to Criterion C, Curriculum for formation and education.

### SECTION THREE: MINISTERIAL DEVELOPMENT

### D Community and corporate life

Reviewers will consider the institution's quality of common life. Is it a good place in which to live, work and study? How is community built across local training contexts and in 'dispersed' mode?

- D.i The institution should offer a clear statement of how it understands corporate life, reflected in its training for ministry and the working relationships between members.
- 21. This is dealt with in the excellent Student Handbook and the paper on Liturgical Formation for Ministry. The former students (now ordained) that were contacted spoke universally highly of the College life and pattern of formation and its abiding significance in their ministerial lives. The reviewers found a community life at Mirfield that amply demonstrated the value for ministry of a residential College of this kind.
- 22. Students were generally pleased that Mirfield is not a College that attracts only like-minded people but reflects the true "catholicity" of the Church of England. Students come to Mirfield from a wide range of church backgrounds: the reviewers talked to students from Pentecostal, evangelical, Quaker, Salvation Army and Anglo-Catholic backgrounds. All feel welcome and all value the particular heritage they inhabit so deeply at Mirfield. Most students expressed sincere appreciation of the College's relationship with the *Community* of the Resurrection, and believe that their ordination training is significantly enriched by its context in a monastic community of prayer and social justice.
- 23. A number of students commented that they value the way the College makes its primary focus one of prayer rather than identity – whether doctrinal, gender, sexual, denominational or academic. They spoke of wanting to be trained as a priest rather than as a woman priest or a priest of a particular orientation.
- 24. Two reviewers talked to some student families. The general consensus was that Mirfield did a very good job at including partners and children in College life and this could be made clearer in advertising the College. However, it is sometimes hard for some families to juggle the demands of College and family life. College was generally seen to be sympathetic to this and flexible

if there were particular challenges; however, the expectations of involvement in daily worship are high. A number of the former students contacted are married and spoke well of their time at Mirfield, both those who came into residence as a family and those who were in effect weekly commuters. One indicated that a degree of sacrifice is involved in attaining any significant spiritual growth.

- D.ii There should be a clear statement of its understanding of issues of gender, ethnic grouping and disability and other matters of natural justice; its training, governance and community life should reflect this (see also I.v and J.ii).
- 25. The reviewers were impressed with the College's approach to issues of gender and other matters of natural justice. The College works very hard and successfully to achieve an authentic and honest community which comprises members who hold different views on some fundamental and potentially divisive issues in the Church of England, most notably women's ministry. A number of students expressed appreciation for the fact that being resident in a small community makes it virtually impossible to avoid engaging with others who hold fundamentally different views on significant issues. The challenges of learning to navigate the diversity with grace. honesty and love, were seen to be an invaluable preparation for ministry and for the most part, the College does an excellent job of sustaining a genuinely 'catholic' community with integrity and grace. A number of people - staff and students - commented on the achievement of managing to celebrate Holy Week and Easter together in a way that enabled everyone to participate with integrity and a genuine sense of community. This had involved painstaking preparation, honest discussion and reflection. The women ordinands we talked to all spoke positively about their experience as women at Mirfield – they felt affirmed and well-prepared for ministry.
- 26. The fact that the full-time teaching staff comprises ordained women is, for most members of College, a very welcome development. The women members of staff were highly respected academically, pastorally and, by the vast majority, of College members, in their priestly ministry. This is a challenging area in which to sustain unity in diversity but in general, thanks to high levels of maturity and a very gifted staff team who model a high degree of collegiality, the College does this very well.
- 27. However, this achievement is in the context of a fragile and evolving ecology which needs continuing careful nurturing, negotiation, honesty and grace (see Introduction paragraph 5). The College Council needs to attend

carefully to this dimension of College life and to ensure that it has the capacity to offer appropriate oversight, leadership and scrutiny in this area.

### **Recommendation 2**

We recommend that the College Council pays particular attention to, and supports the staff in handling, these difficult matters of diversity.

- D.iii Does the institution have clear and well-managed policies for the safeguarding of children and vulnerable adults?
- 28. The Church of England's national policy on safeguarding is in place at the College. In addition, the College Council adopted a specific guidance note on safeguarding in November 2014 (designed to supplement the Church of England's national guidance) and reviewed it in October 2015 on the back of a helpful report from the Director of Pastoral Studies who is the College safeguarding officer. In addition, we obtained evidence that effective safeguarding is provided to the students to help them prepare for parish life, and judge that this important issue is currently being addressed affectively with the help of the diocesan safeguarding officer who is also a Council member.

The review team has Confidence with regard to Criterion D, Community and corporate life.

#### E Worship and training in public worship

Reviewers will look at whether the arrangements for common worship and the policies underlying them are satisfactory.

- *E.i* The institution's policy and practice in corporate worship should reflect the tradition and liturgical inheritance of the wider church.
- 29. The College's policy and practice in corporate worship reflects the tradition and liturgical inheritance of the wider church. The policy is set out coherently in the college paper entitled "Liturgical Formation at the College of the Resurrection" and the observations of the reviewers confirm that this policy is followed thoroughly in practice. The concern is to develop clergy who "inhabit" worship so that this impacts on ministerial practice through those who are "being a liturgical person". The worship is based on a strong sense of the individual offering their worship as part of a community of prayer in which all are part of a whole. This is reflected in the blending of voices

during the recitation of psalms, speaking and singing. This is seen in the College's own worship as well as when the College participates in the evenings and Sunday mornings with the Community of the Resurrection.

- 30. The timing of early morning prayer and the eucharist on Sundays allows for ordinands to be involved later in the morning in the main Sunday service of local placement parishes. We comment further on this in section H.
- E.ii There should be a policy on, and provision for, a balance of worship, including authorised and innovative forms, which recognises and equips candidates to work within the variety of practice within the sponsoring church.
- 31. Former and present ordinands attest that for the most part the pattern of college worship is formative for them and a rich resource for their spiritual life while at College and after this while sustaining the demands of ordained ministry. This is important because the College finds that ordinands arrive with less practical understanding of liturgy and worship than in previous years, and often having only (given the range of churchmanship) particular and fairly limited ranges of experience in worship. For example, the College worship enables all ordinands to be immersed in the traditions of the church, such as the progression of Holy Week. Worship includes provision to experience the Book of Common Prayer, as set out in College policy. For example, the reviewers observed in the teaching of liturgy an excellent account of the historical development and contemporary relevance of Christian worship, including a clear exposition of the genesis and significance of the Book of Common Prayer.
- 32. With regard to preparing for the variety of practice in future ministry, the provision of worship within the College needs to be seen alongside the wider range of opportunities to experience and participate in worship in placements and parishes. We have good evidence that this succeeds with regard to authorised forms of worship and their application to mission situations in church contexts. For example, the course on liturgy includes provision for teams to prepare a Liturgy Construction Exercise, which is part of the marked and assessed course. The reviewers were able to read some impressive examples of these exercises, including worship for the recently bereaved at All Souls and an All Age Eucharist. There are also voluntary opportunities for students to meet for other forms of corporate prayer in the evenings, including for example the Jesus prayer, lectio divina and the rosary, and the reviewers saw these as significant occasions.

33. The College policy is more hesitant with regard to "innovative worship" and speaks rather in terms of "exploratory worship" which is "authentic and appropriate to the setting and occasion", such that the worship is not a dutiful act to fulfil an objective or artificial and contrived. This is a fair point but mission amongst the unchurched (outside church contexts) can call for worship which is able to reach out and connect in ways that need to be innovative. In future, clergy will often need to be able to "form" new Christians in experiences of worship and of being the Church where the new Christians have little previous experience of prayer and collective worship. The need for additional help with mission and worship skills in this kind of situation is made in some otherwise very supportive feedback from former students. The reviewers are concerned to ensure that ordinands currently trained at the College are also being prepared to be spiritual resources in this kind of situation. There are a number of settings for innovative worship which can be seen to be genuine and authentic: the College in its own worship; the experience of worship in parishes where ordinands worshipped before their entry to training; and College placements. The reviewers found, amongst the current student body, a resource of previous experience in innovative worship that some ordinands can articulate. In asking that further attention is given to how to promote reflection and learning about innovative worship, which is authentic to its setting, we have a concern also for the preparation of the ordinands for their practice of mission. The following recommendation reflects that concern, and is also based on comments found in section F.iii.

### **Recommendation 3**

We recommend that additional provision is made for equipping ordinands with regard to mission, worship and preaching for contexts "outside" the church, where people have limited knowledge and contact with the church and the Christian Faith.

- 34. The Mirfield Liturgical Institute, founded in 2008 and led by a staff member, provides teaching and modules in liturgy for both the undergraduate and MA programmes. There are opportunities also for serving clergy to study liturgy through the Institute as part of continuing ministerial education. The Institute's work and interests are reflected in a number of liturgical publications and represent a significant contribution made by the College.
- *E.iii* Ministerial candidates should be effectively trained to plan, prepare and conduct public worship and appropriate for their particular

ministry (lay or ordained), and they should receive critical and constructive comment from staff and peers.

- 35. In line with the College policy, we found good arrangements in place for the preparation of worship which is offered in the College. This is carried our through tutor groups, where feedback is given, as well as from personal tutors and the Dean of Chapel. We observed very well led worship in which students seemed confident and capable.
- 36. The College policy sets our arrangements for preparation and training in preaching, which is closely followed, and found to be supportive by students who are in many cases new to preaching. This includes, step by step, preaching in a group, in a placement and before the College community. There are effective proformas to ensure feedback is given. All this is valued and appreciated by current and former students.
- 37. A thorough course in communication and preaching makes good links between training in liturgy and in pastoral practice. This covers well preaching at main Sunday services and at the occasional offices, and has regard to mission through the church. There is some feedback that further help could be given specifically with preaching and explaining the Christian Faith in contexts "outside the church", which is expected of the newly ordained in some mission situations. Given the current diversity of churchmanship within the ordinand body, this seems an appropriate request so that the training fully matches the range of future situations which the ordinands will be likely to enter. This is referred to in the recommendation mentioned above and found in section Fiii.
- *E.iv* The liturgical space should be adequate for its purpose.
- 38. The College benefits from two recent re-orderings of its physical locations for worship. The Community of the Resurrection Chapel enables ordinands to participate around the circle that "surrounds" the monastic community at worship. This is a well-lit and spacious environment. The College's own chapel, used in the mornings, is a reflective space which is adaptable and well designed for the College at worship. The college also has an oratory which is an excellent space in the main building for individual prayer as well as for the informal groups meeting for evening prayers (mentioned in Eii).

## The review team has Confidence with qualifications with regard to Criterion E, Worship and training in public worship.

### F Ministerial, personal and spiritual formation

Reviewers will consider how well the institution helps learners in their ministerial, personal and spiritual formation and self-awareness, and in their understanding of the specific lay or ordained ministry to which they are called .

- *F.i* The institution should enable candidates to be immersed in the traditions of their own church denomination and to gain an empathetic understanding of church and faith traditions other than their own.
- 39. At the core of the self-consciousness of the College lies its vision of priestly formation of "men and women called by God to grow in faith, hope and love in order that they may fulfill their vocation as deacons and priests sharing in the priesthood of Christ" (Student Handbook 2015-2016). This is articulated in terms of learning to participate in a community of Christians, crucially significant to one another, seeking the Lord's will, sharing life and prayer in service of one another, caught up in the rhythm of the liturgy and in the worship of a monastic community, and immersed in theological study that is inseparable from many forms of prayer. The Briefing Paper received by the Reviewers (8.10.15) confidently sets the resolve and achievement of the College as maintaining and constantly renewing a 100 year old tradition of corporate prayer and learning, informed by a common life, purposefully embracing diversity, that seeks to rigorously discern the will of God and attempt to be faithful to it.
- 40. In similar vein, the College brochure offers a uniquely integrated programme, with encountering God in prayer at its heart, a uniquely holistic atmosphere in which to develop both as a person and as a future priest, and in which to foster habits to carry students into future ministry. As will be described at section H, all of these interrelated experiences are informed by the study of theology and grounded in the practice of Theological Reflection (TR).
- 41. The Reviewers took many opportunities to hear from students, DDOs, placement and attachment supervisors and training incumbents, their personal reflections on the content, style and quality of formation offered at the College. Without exception, they discovered a deep gratitude for the formational pathway offered by the College, evoking a deep loyalty and commitment, even though inevitably there were matters that could still be addressed. One spoke of the College as a "virtue-forming community" (created through mutual hospitality, care and service) inspiring students to

recognize this practice as a rigorous exercise in self-awareness as, in a mutual accountability, they allowed their vocations to be developed. Another expressed this in terms of a spirit of generosity, emanating from a monastic spirituality in which an ever-searching spirituality and a vision of humanity grounded in God are indivisible.

- 42. In a rapidly changing church within a societal climate suspicious of religious commitment, an experienced DDO valued the continuity of the College's essentially catholic expression of Anglicanism as a raft for sustaining future priests. He affirmed the characteristic "confidence, clarity and poise" of those who have been formed in devotional and community disciplines at the College. Further, the College's pronounced incarnational stance with the poor and the disadvantaged he found to be a crucial stance from which to undertake mission and ministry, always "with a degree of playful and ironic detachment".
- 43. While admiring the tremendously powerful, motivating and energetic life of the College, several voices from the DDOs and Training Incumbents suggested that further attention should be given to how to assist students make the transition from the intense and rich experience of liturgy and community living to the sometimes isolating and uncertain landscape of parish curacy. In particular, it was suggested a) that students need support not to imagine they can replicate the "Mirfield experience" within a different parish context and b) that those who are naturally more dependent on the support of corporate prayer need careful nurturing if they are to be prepared for the change of circumstances that have left a few "floundering".

#### **Recommendation 4**

We recommend that the College explores with former students, when seeking feedback as envisaged in the new college Plan (objective 3), information about their experiences of transition from the Mirfield pattern to their parochial situation, and to consider whether further helps is needed with transition, for example in the final term Leavers' course or in some other way.

44. The role and value of Placements and Attachments deserves an extended comment. To be clear about terminology, a blurring can occur between the two terms "placement" and "attachment". The Reviewers' understanding was that "placement" referred to a block of time in the summer, or a

shorter sequence of weeks in term time, when a student could be released into full immersion in a pastoral situation, without the tension of also attending to academic demands. "Attachment" is the term used to refer to students when engaged in a two-term Sunday involvement in local churches, which would include a one week full immersion, which might be called an "Attachment".

- 45. The Reviewers were especially grateful to Attachment and Placement supervisors who engaged in a conversation together or sent written submissions. A significant assessment of the importance and value of the current arrangements for placements came from a priest with fifteen years of involvement with Mirfield in this arena. His comments, reinforced by other supervisors, included the watchfulness of the Director of Pastoral Studies both for student and supervisor, the opportunity for students to enhance their pastoral skills through observing at close quarter "the challenges and rewards of providing religious spiritual care in a complex environment" beyond the local church. This went some way to redress the need for students to reflect on mission outside the circle of those "automatically sympathetic to theological ideas or practices.
- 46. It was important for the Reviewers to engage in conversation with present students on the issues of formation. Student comments included that space and solidity provide an adventurous basis in which to engage with vital challenges for their inner journey and spiritual and human development, and that they come to appreciate the value of formal liturgical and common life. This common life was spoken of by some as nurturing and attractive as it curated a space characterized by a genuine commitment to listening to and being enriched by those holding very different views. There was evidence of an appreciation of a sense of a mutuality (not a vertically orientated hierarchy) which could be carried through into a relational ontology of priesthood. For example, it had proved to be a secure place to explore, with honesty, tough questions together, notably around the call of women to priesthood.
- 47. Some students spoke with approval of the fostering of a desire to promote a co-responsible ecclesiology for developing missional and ministerial patterns in parish life. Observation of students on parish placement in both urban and semi-rural congregations offered a striking reminder of the difficulty of resisting the natural inclination of a congregation to view clergy

and ordinands mostly as providers rather than as trustworthy stimulators of ministry.

- 48. Although a widespread outside impression may still be that the College is loyal to a single, particular aspect of Anglicanism, the reviewers found a spectrum of spiritual and theological positions, though within certain limits. The Reviewers observed that, while although the College consciously works for a liturgical homogeneity, one indeed that had attracted and stimulated students, the range of Anglicanism from which students had come and into which they would be deployed as curates, was notably diverse. A Placement supervisor over many years was at pains to recognize the wide range of the students as well as of the parishes and clergy with whom they work. One Placement supervisor (an ordained woman) related that the opportunity for a woman ordinand to have time with a woman priest while on placement provided time to reflect on what can be painful as well as affirming in their experience in the College.
- *F.ii* It should offer corporate and individual guidance for learners, including encouragement to seek confidential spiritual counsel and to maintain a regular private prayer life.
- 49. An intrinsic component of the College is its setting within the life and grounds of the Community of the Resurrection with its distinctive and vibrant history of contributing to the life of the Anglican Communion. This has been characterized thorough a remarkable, yet humble, common life daily focused on being present to God in worship, prayer and scripture, and consequently supportive and challenging to many people and places. The College brochure spoke eloquently of a common life arising through participating in corporate worship, a mutually accountable discipline of personal prayer, an attitude of mutual encouragement and a desire to stir up the gift of the Holy Spirit. By setting time aside each day to pray alone and in community, students learn to "rest in the love of God who strengthens us, frees us to serve, and helps us to receive from others". It is a core value of the college to help students establish this rhythm as a stable foundation for lifelong ministry as deacons and priests.
- 50. The Director of Pastoral Studies described, in tune with the Student Handbook, how students are supported personally in growing in a life of prayer. This develops through a climate of regular patterns of worship in word and sacrament. The corporate silence, after Compline through until

after breakfast, was embraced as a daily reference point for students as individuals within community. She also emphasized how the sometimes arduous discipline of learning to live in touch with very different people could both foster a rich and mutually supportive college culture and foster personal maturing.

- 51. An "active contemplative" student emphasized how the college experience was building on a long appreciation of her own practice of silence and meditation. During the Review period students were given the opportunity to engage in an Ignatian Retreat led by a team from St Beuno's, held within the College. The Reviewers noted that the necessary (mostly financial) constraint of holding a retreat on site was far from ideal though every effort was made to help students make this their focused priority. The College staff recognised that, although for some personalities this would not be a productive pathway to follow, the experience had offered the opportunity to engage with an unfamiliar spiritual path. Student engagement had been palpable and feedback positive, especially as the retreat leaders also offered workshops on a variety of ways of praying.
- 52. Another important element in the College formation was the daily rhythm of early morning worship in the Lower Church before breakfast. The Reviewers concurred with the Briefing Paper that the reordered Lower Church had released students into a growth-promoting environment for participatory liturgy. It was clearly an appreciated ingredient in the students' formation, guite independent of the rich resource of the expression of the monastic inheritance in the Community Church. In the period before Morning Prayer students gradually gathered within an environment conducive for corporate silent prayer and showed confidence as they fulfilled the necessary tasks for the effective flow of the liturgy. The reviewers concluded that this worship created a pivotal element of student formation in prayer and community living. To describe this as "no frills Anglicanism" – a phrase heard more than once – was a stretch, though it certainly was entirely Anglican material, albeit offered in a disciplined ascetic style to which few local churches could aspire.
- 53. The Reviewers held a meeting with 25 students on the four criteria of the Mirfield programme in Spiritual Formation. Reflections that emerged included the following:

- We share life and prayer in service of one another
- Sustaining one another through corporate prayer
- Service to each other in taking responsibility, sharing them with each other, at table, in the liturgy, in the running of the community and common life
- Diversity in prayer groups voluntarily set up addressing a more specific set of needs as well as a common corporate prayer life
- It is a disposition we are obliged to one another even when we don't feel like praying. A shared responsibility that includes: liturgy, table, hospitality, building
- Sharing of experiences and knowledge
- Provision of pilgrimages extra-curricular spiritual development voluntarily
- There is no Mirfield "type" though we share a common attitude and primary purpose
- We are caught up in the rhythm of the liturgy and the worship of a monastic community
- Yes we are caught up in the liturgy and life of the College; it's part of the reason people come here we know and choose this, "but it's about the faith, not dressing up".
- It's "no frills" Anglican Catholicism
- It prepares you for giving your all to priestly ministry
- We believe in theological study that is inseparable from contemplation of the Word made flesh
- The library and our prayer lives are held in creative tension: book and altar: both connect us with God
- We are challenged in the liturgy; praying helps us understand Christology
- Prayer helps us write sermons
- We have critical engagement with Sheffield students
- We engage with sharp theological questions with those with whom we pray
- Here our deepest foundations are shaken both brain and heart.
- F.iii Its common life and the guidance offered should enable students to grow in Christian discipleship, in readiness to share their faith, and as theologically reflective practitioners, with a view to exercising a public role in ministry and engaging in the world.

- 54. To foster and maintain a culture of student-centred maturity is an allembracing dimension of the College's purpose. The College in its Brochure seeks students who desire support in the learning task of taking personal responsibility for their own formation for Christian ministry within a corporate setting. It continues to explain that while personal paths may vary, formation is delivered through five connected strands: community, spiritualty, ministry, study and reflection. The college claims that the focus on community and of serving one another also develops in students a high sensitivity to the needs of others – an invaluable gift in future ministry especially in times when patience is taxed. The Brochure advocates the learning of humility in times of success and a journey towards real confidence when, in the gift of ordination, students find themselves becoming the person God is calling them to be.
- 55. Conversations with groups of students and spouses revealed their deliberate and eager choice to attend a college that sought to heighten awareness and immersion in practices of social holiness. Issues that continually emerged were their wide range of spiritual pathways, the desire to live in a disciplined community, the search for a ground base to support future ministry, an eager response to the opportunity of high quality learning, appreciation of the advantages of integration of academy and seminary, hope and passion for God and God's mission. (See also section Ki).
- 56. The Briefing Paper highlighted that liturgical formation at the College is inspired by the question, "what does it mean to be a worshipping person?" The aim is to give equal priority to learning how to be a praying Christian and how to exercise leadership in shaping and leading liturgy. Certainly students were proud to speak of the college as geared to foster the learning of a self-imposed discipline, mutual accountability, prayer and theological study. All those to whom we spoke were glad to be in a place which invites students to take developmental journeys with utter seriousness. Students could also speak of the experience of genuine joy in silence, liturgy and informal evenings. This resonates well with the Briefing Paper's references to (and the reviewer's experience of) a regular feature of College life focused on a Thursday evening Eucharist "planned by the member of staff presiding and student liturgy and music officers, followed by drinks, supper and a social evening".

- 57. Student written assignments demonstrated a serious theory/practice engagement with issues directly concerning churches themselves and also their relations with different faiths and society. The Reviewers had opportunity to read a cross section of students' assignments and critical evaluations, for example on the rationale for engaging with Church Schools in a missionary context, pastoral care for a mother after the trauma of the death of an infant, and other significant pastoral encounters. There was evidence of a search to grow in empathy, self-awareness and the bounds of confidentiality within the overarching focus of personal maturing and formation for public ministry. In the field of local churches in mission students had engaged with topics such as the relationship between Jesus as both guest and host and the ministry of a church reflecting the hospitality of God in today's world, the rationale of Reader ministry, and Christian Stewardship.
- 58. There was a purposeful insistence on holding a balance between the need for common sense and human strategy and openness to God's mercy and blessing as the initiator, inspirer and keeper of Christian ministry and mission. Verbatim accounts of pastoral encounters indicated the versatility of students in attempting to connect with the language and experiences of others. Written pieces also engaged rigorously with current literature on how churches contribute to debates in the public square, the interconnection between the worshipping community and Kingdom issues such as poverty and hunger, how churches are instrumental for the flourishing of their locality and to the ethics of end of life care.
- 59. The Reviewers, aware of a movement within many Anglican churches to seek to connect in fresh and imaginative ways with a general public that has lost connectivity with Christian worship, were keen to discover how the College was preparing clergy able to work, critically, on the cusp of liturgical approaches apt for enquirers.
- 60. As noted in section E, the Briefing Paper takes a narrow, even critical, approach to the authenticity of "Exploratory Worship", and a recommendation is made in section E.ii. However, it was abundantly clear from a cross section of student reflective writing that they were open to both contemporary debate in the wider Church and empirical observation in local churches on how regular worship can be accessible and stimulating to all ages.

- 61. The Reviewers were aware of the College curriculum regularly helping students to connect their understanding of future ministry with inter-faith contact and conversations e.g. visits to a Sikh temple. Noting how the College is well-placed, geographically, to assist students to be formed within the cross-cultural and inter-religious character of significant tracts of West Yorkshire, the Reviewers were glad to learn of a group of third year students taking part in research entitled "Faith and Britishness Project". In the wake of the new emphasis of the UK Government to promote "fundamental British values" as an attempt to counter religious extremism, the project offered students opportunity explore the relationship between Britishness, "British values", and faith identity in university students, from both Christian and Muslim perspectives.
- *F.iv* The teaching and ministerial staff should model an appropriate pattern of spirituality, continued learning and refection on practice.
- 62. The Reviewers had a strong sense of student confidence in their tutors, courses of study, and the appropriate conditions generated within college life as a whole. The staff plays a considerable role in curating a space in which students of many backgrounds and theologies can be welcomed, flourish and eventually be sent out from. The Reviewers applauded the deep quality of pastoral care offered to individuals with personal issues and conflicts, held with the responsibility of challenging students to discover rigorous spiritual disciplines and the positive reinforcement, mixed with critique for instance in sermon critique and assignment marking.
- 63. Several staff and students emphasized how great a care was taken over matching students to placements and attachments, bearing in mind the breadth of student personalities and their previous life and work experience.
- 64. Staff members were habitually offering high quality role modelling as, in turn, they presided at the Eucharist and sometimes offer a homily. Within a unified liturgical practice, the different personalities subtly demonstrated the possibilities for heterogeneity. Courtesy and self-awareness were encouraged and inevitable tensions contained, especially around holding together students committed to potentially conflicting views on ordination and gender.

65. Two married staff were offering contrasting models of family living in the context of demanding professional routines. They added value by demonstrating through college life how ministry can be an authentic sacrificial gift when held in balance with the dynamics of family and of self-nurture. The Review team was very aware of how over-stretched the staff were and held this in tension with the significance of the staff as role models, not least in terms of time management and work-life balance, to those preparing for parish ministry (see also section I).

The review team has Confidence with regard to Criterion F, Ministerial, personal and spiritual formation.

### SECTION FOUR: EDUCATION AND TRAINING

### G Teaching and learning: content, method and resources

Reviewers will consider the quality and effectiveness of teaching and learning activities, methods and resources.

- G.i The units of teaching and learning should be well structured, with clear and appropriate aims.
- 66. The reviewers looked carefully at the Education and Training provision of the College, attending classes both in Mirfield and in Sheffield, looked at examples of assessed work, and listened carefully to student feedback. The student consensus is that the teaching at Mirfield is uniformly very good. Each full-time member of staff was singled out by numbers of students as excellent. One student who spent a year training in an Oxbridge College volunteered that the standards of teaching he was receiving at Mirfield was of a similar high standard. The units of teaching are well structured, with clear and appropriate aims.
- G.ii There should be a proper balance between the academic, formational and practical aspects of training.
- 67. There is an excellent balance between the academic, formational and practical aspects of training and a high degree of integration between them, with explicit invitation being made to students within specific units to consider the implications for ordained ministry and the parish setting. Students are also encouraged to relate what they are learning to the wider historical and cultural context. Considerable care is shown in terms of placements to maximise student exposure and learning, A number of students commented on the way in which, in a small residential community, academic learning and intellectual and spiritual formation are inextricably entwined in everyday life; living along-side one's teachers ensures that there is a high degree of integration between the academic courses, theological reflection and the whole of one's life, and the students expressed enthusiastic appreciation of this.
- G.iii Learning programmes should be varied in format and method, with use of student experience, courses, seminars, tutorials, one-to-one, groups, placements and private study.

- 68. Learning programmes are varied in format and method. Appreciation was expressed by students for the variety of teaching styles used the lecture format is most common, but reviewers witnessed or were made aware of the use of seminars, theme teaching, small interactive group learning, tutorials, regular one-to-one interactions, imaginative use of varieties of media, and plenty of evidence of private study. Within this variety of formats, there is a thoughtful blend of the communication of staff expertise and knowledge and the eliciting of questions and contributions from students. Students use experience and learning from their pre-training contexts to enrich their own and others' theological reflection.
- 69. The challenge of teaching mixed ability and mixed educational background classes is handled skilfully and sensitively with appropriate challenge for the more academically experienced students and encouragement for those without much prior academic training; this leads to classes with a high degree of mature and thoughtful engagement from all students.
- 70. The relationship with Sheffield University is valued by both Mirfield and Sheffield; staff from both institutions and Mirfield students believe that the students from both institutions benefit from learning alongside each other. Mirfield students are generally appreciated as bright and engaged. Students expressed their appreciation of the dimension added by the Sheffield learning context. The teaching offered at Sheffield is seen as mixed – some outstanding, some niche enough to be of questionable value to ordinands (although even here, some defended the usefulness of ordinands of having to engage with theology clearly not within a church or even Christian context).
- 71. The relationship between Sheffield and Mirfield is important in helping to ensure that the academic standard of Mirfield College staff remains high, and the opportunity for ordinands to learn within the context of a secular University is seen as invaluable it offers exposure to rigorous thinking in a secular context which Mirfield students view as important given their context as a priest will be secular. Sheffield brings the resources of a big University that a small theological College could never match, including disability support, funding, equipment, and specialist supervision for postgraduate students; whilst from Sheffield's point of view, the Mirfield involvement makes it possible to justify running some of the more purely theological and biblical courses.

- 72. The relationship does add an extra layer of complexity to managing the Sheffield department, but Sheffield's commitment to the partnership has been confirmed in a renewal of the partnership to the satisfaction of both parties. One reviewer observed three teaching units at Sheffield one by a Mirfield staff member, the other two by members of the Sheffield faculty. The sessions were uniformly of a high standard.
- 73. Commuting to Sheffield from Mirfield takes about an hour each way; cars may be borrowed from the College and students are positive about the conversation and reflection that can take placed on these journeys.
- G.iv There should be an appropriate learning environment, with adequate resources including library and information and communications technology.
- 74. Reviewers were satisfied that there is a good learning environment at Mirfield, with excellent library resources and good access to information and communications technology.
- G.v Staff should provide students with constructive formal and informal feedback assessment, against published assessment criteria, in terms of both academic progress and preparation for beginning public ministry.
- 75. Staff provide students with constructive formal feedback on assessed work. Students report that feedback is usually prompt and helpful. Reviewers studied samples of written feedback and confirmed that this is of a high standard, often specific, constructively critical and appropriately challenging and encouraging. The College's model of community ensures that there is a high degree of informal feedback in tutor groups, at mealtimes and other social settings, and students value this integrated learning and formation very highly. Students are invited to submit feedback on their teaching and learning experiences and this indicates a high level of satisfaction with all courses offered.

The review team has Confidence with regard to Criterion G, Teaching and learning: content, method and resources.

# H Practical and pastoral theology

- H.i The institution's learning structures and formational activity should integrate theory and practice and enable students to grow as theologically reflective practitioners in the context of the developing and diverse society in which they will minister.
- 76. Theological reflection, "why we do what we do", amplified by theological and prayerful insight, is a learned discipline into which all students were initiated from the moment of entering the College. It offers a perspective, constantly commended and rehearsed in journalling, reflection on complex experiences and the development of self-awareness in varied circumstances. Theological reflection was presented in the College as an interdisciplinary approach, fostering the habit of intentional listening to often conflicting narratives about and encounters with experience. TR draws together practice and theory as a creative dialogue, rooted in relationships and experiences as a vehicle of transformation for individuals and teams. The staff team had grown together a commitment to embedding this approach to priestly formation, willingly recognizing how different personality types are naturally drawn to and flourish through a variety approaches (as identified notably in the work of James Woodward). The Team has confidence that the disciplines of TR are fully embedded in the curriculum and furthermore that routinely it informs the College holistically: head, heart and body.
- 77. In a skilfully designed and led seminar that began by absorbing recent statistics and projections of Church allegiance, the whole student body gathered engaged honestly and compassionately with the fragility of many of the churches to which they had been attached. While they displayed an enthusiasm for renewing the faith of existing worshippers through catechesis, "messy church" as a prelude to mission and evangelism, the team did not find enthusiasm for imagining how they would support parishes in communicating the gospel to the growing number of those currently 'outside' the church; and the team would have appreciated finding a greater capacity for this. At another informal, voluntary gathering, a high proportion of the students welcomed the challenge of ministry in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. Specifically, they recorded their sense of being supported by the College in that
  - tutor and peer groups help us to tie everything together
  - here we get the philosophical challenge; the practical answers are elsewhere

- here we are helped to face big questions to help us engage seriously with how to be church in a very different world; we are drawn together from different backgrounds
- we're being formed to stand with churches on the cusp of the future
- 78. The Placements and Attachments policy document and the Briefing Paper emphasize that pastoral placements and attachments play an invaluable role in the formation for ordained ministry. Students are guided to undertake a variety of roles and experiences as part of their preparation for the varied demands of ministry. So, for example, one student was directed away from a placement he personally favoured, to ensure he gained experience in a field that as neither known nor attractive to him. Further, placements and attachments provide students with particular opportunities for deepening their understanding and appreciation of the connections between the life of prayer, rigorous theological study, and pastoral practice.
- 79. The policy is based on the assumption that placements and attachments provide a critical context in which students can grow in self-knowledge and in the wisdom required to meet the challenges and joys of ordained ministry.
- 80. Reviewers accompanied students on placement in a city parish where the population was said to be 90% Muslim and in which adversarial tensions existed. The reviewers observed that the students were warmly greeted by people who were used to receiving students from the college. On this occasion the students were observers of the worship, a specially designed Remembrance Service attended by some 30 people. They were broadly appreciative of the service, considering how it connected with the people present, and they used their training so far to critique the sermon.
- 81. A student described how through an attachment to a hospice she had experienced profound, painful and personal learning. Another student told the review team that "despite this Hogwartian setting", and especially through the provision of Spiritual Direction, the college provides a very stable basis for the serious internal challenges required in priestly formation. The team also observed a student on placement in a hospital where it was clear that he and the chaplain had established a working relationship in which there was a genuine opportunity to learn both from pastoral encounters and theological reflection.
- 82. Supervisors of attachments to a project among the homeless and a mental health team also demonstrated how students were being safely given

experiences of immersion in non-parochial but vital elements of the Church's ministry within situations where human lives were often in the midst of chaos and "a roller coaster of emotions". The Director of Pastoral Studies was at pains to match these opportunities to issues raised in BAP reports and to enlarge the scope of students' knowledge of life and Christian ministry. It was clear that a reciprocal relationship between the College and attachments kept an ongoing watchful eye on the quality of such experiences and the capacity of students to reflect on them and so to increase their resilience for the future.

- 83. The Reviewers heard from a representative and highly motivated group of Placement and Attachment supervisors. In cooperation with the Director of Pastoral Studies, increasingly they and local churches had a sense of being partners in the formation of students. Parish connections combined with academic modules were seen to be working together to help students link theological study with the realities and challenges of contemporary church life and a variety of settings. Clearly local churches also benefitted from the affirmation of being entrusted with part of the formation of clergy, affectionately known as "our students". There was evidence in some cases that this bond between student and congregation could continue to be mutually supportive after ordination.
- 84. A notable testimony from a group of parishes that had had a succession of students on Placement was that the solid grounding in liturgy, learning and community formation had given students freedom, vision and competence in supporting parishes grow in confidence about faith development and evangelism. Other Placement supervisors expressed pleasure at a growing sense of their being a key part of the formation process, not least through the introduction of dedicated weeks in which students were free of academic commitments in order to be fully present to liturgical, pastoral and social events in their placement parish. Generally, the Placement supervisors looked forward to continued opportunities for conferring together with the Director of Pastoral Studies who had a policy of being available on a one-to-one basis with attachment supervisors from across a broad spectrum of situations e.g. schools, prison and hospitals.
- 85. The Reviewers agreed on the need for the College to revisit a recurring question, identified by all the Placement supervisors present at a meeting, of the wisdom of students being expected to attend the Community Sunday Eucharist prior to travelling to their Placement churches. The reasons for

dis-ease on this score were a) ecclesiological, the Reviewers reflected that the present practice gave out an implicit message of Church as something "provided" by visiting clergy rather than "co-created" within a community of Christians locally, including the clergy. b) formational, the Reviewers reflected that this practice of arriving at one or more local churches having already participated in a beautifully presented monastic mass was conflictual with the College's curriculum and community commitment to advocating collegiality among all God's people in localities. The Reviewers accepted the view of some Placement supervisors that (however unsatisfactory it is on every count) current normative practice in the Church of England increasingly demands of priests that they spend Sunday moving from presiding at one church to another. Students need to be acclimatized to learning how to remain resilient in the realities of this present climate c) pragmatic, supervisors explained how attendance at the College Eucharist could often result in students arriving too late in the parishes for the first of a series of acts of worship. As one supervisor put it, "it's vital in the current less than ideal practice that clergy learn quickly to handle with energy and sensitivity the rhythm between presiding, preaching and navigating their car from one church to the next through a Sunday morning". The Reviewers, noting the practice of other colleges on Sundays, agreed that it would be appropriate for the College to reconsider both the ideal and practices involved and hopefully find alternative ways for students to be nurtured by the liturgy of the monastic community.

# **Recommendation 5**

We recommend that the College reviews the requirement that all ordinands attend the early morning Sunday eucharist on every occasion, so as to facilitate the opportunity for greater engagement and learning when in placement parishes on Sunday mornings.

86. Generally, in conversation with students, there emerged a vital sense of purpose and engagement with the work of preparing for priesthood in the Church for today's world. We witnessed a serious commitment to taking on board the critical issues, challenges, and renewal in the life of society that require a sharp intellectual, spiritual and emotional focus.

# The review team has Confidence with regard to Criterion H, Practical and pastoral theology.

# SECTION FIVE: STAFF AND STUDENTS

Reviewers will consider the recruitment, expertise, resourcing, appraisal and development of staff.

# I Teaching staff

- I.i The gender, lay/ordained and denominational balance of ministerial and teaching staff should model appropriate patterns of learning and of ministry and comply with denominational guidelines.
- 87. There is an excellent balance of staff at Mirfield: two highly experienced, highly qualified ordained women (one with good parish experience) and two highly experienced and highly qualified men. Between them, they offer as good a range of models of ministry as is perhaps possible in a small staff team: the Principal is a monk, the other male member of staff is married with children, one female member of staff is married and a mother, one is ordained and celibate. The review team witnessed both women playing their full role in the College's liturgical life and both are highly respected (along with their male colleagues) in their ministerial, academic and pastoral identities.

The review team has Confidence with regard to Criterion I, Teaching staff.

# J All staff

- J.i Staff recruitment and selection procedures should be transparent, fair and consonant with the policies of the relevant partner bodies.
- J.ii Job descriptions, terms of service and reporting lines should be clear at the time of appointment and reviewed at regular intervals.
- J.iii There should be an effective programme for the continuing professional development of staff, including annual appraisals for all staff.
- J.iv Staff should be sufficient in number and expertise, and resourced to fulfil their role adequately for the institution's and students' needs.
- 88. The review team were confident that the procedures for the appointment of academic staff are transparent, fair and consonant with the practice of the church. The Staff Handbook deals fully with all these matters. The

particular roles of the staff are clear and reviewed. We note the intention to appoint a further member of academic staff who can contribute both an academic subject (possibly biblical studies) and also who can also share in the tutorial responsibility for ministerial formation. We were encouraged that the academic staff continue to contribute to research, conference papers and publications in their respective fields of expertise. We comment on the staff as an effective team in section Fiv.

- 89. The four non-academic staff of the College, the Bursar, the Principal's PA, the Academic Registrar (who is shared with the Yorkshire Ministry Course) and an Administrator who acts as receptionist and admission's officer, all work part time. They all appreciate being employed by the College. Not all their roles are now exactly as described in the College's Governance Manual, which would merit some updating in this regard. In addition, all should have annual appraisals but this is not always happening, presumably because of the considerable time pressures on the Principal. Time pressures on the academic staff more generally have also sometimes meant that communication with support staff is not always as good as it could be, and further efforts in this regard would be appropriate. Finally, all should be given an opportunity to undergo professional development or job specific training on a regular cycle. Both the PA and Administrator, for example, would benefit from regular IT update training.
- 90. The reviewers have commented on the academic staff as being overstretched, and we consider it understandable that the College aspires to appoint a new member of staff, probably one with biblical expertise (to assist the link with Sheffield University) and also someone able to share in the tutorial responsibility for formation.

#### The review team has Confidence with regard to Criterion J, All staff.

#### K Students

Reviewers will examine procedures for student admission, welfare and support, appraisal and discipline.

K.i Policies on students' admission, welfare, complaints, discipline, assessment, reporting to sponsoring churches and arrangements for first appointments should be publicly available; and there should be evidence that they are applied.

- 91. Policies on students' admission, welfare, complaints, discipline and assessment are available in the Student Handbook or the Academic Regulation Handbook and through Annual Self-assessment sheets. Ordinands are admitted according to Church of England policy and procedures.
- *K.ii* The institution's decision-making structure should enable students to take an appropriate part in its governance.
- 92. The College Council has two student representatives and, to maximise student capacity to engage effectively, it has just agreed, in addition, to accept a proposal from the Student Common Room meeting that a third student attend as an observer, with the hope that this student would be elected as the representative for the following year. It was also agreed that student representatives be encouraged to share what is unreserved on Council agendas with their constituency ahead of meetings to allow for greater student engagement and a more effective student voice. Student formal involvement in the College's decision-making structure is being strengthened; informal involvement, thanks to the close involvement of the Principal and staff in daily student life is already good. See also section L and M on Governance and Management.

# The review team has Confidence with regard to Criterion K, Students.

# SECTION SIX: GOVERNANCE, MANAGEMENT AND FINANCE

# L Organisation and governance

Reviewers will examine the effectiveness of the institution's governance structures and processes, recognising that these will be proportionate to the scale of the institution and will not apply identically to, say, a college and a diocesan course:

- L.i The institution should have clear financial, administrative and management structures and an up-to-date governing document, and the governing body should be constituted in line with it.
- L.ii. There should be evidence that the governing body recognises and discharges its role and legal duties in respect of stewardship of the assets; setting and safeguarding the vision, values and reputation and effectiveness of the institution; operational and staff oversight and support.
- L.iii. It should have a mix of skills and experience appropriate to its role; there should be a clear understanding of the respective roles of trustees and staff; induction for new trustees; ongoing training needs should be met.
- 93. The governance structures of the College are both complicated and unusual. It operates under a wholly owned subsidiary of the Community of the Resurrection, the Frere Educational Trust. The Trustees of that Trust, who are, with one exception, all members of the Community, are legally responsible for it. The Community, rather than the College itself, owns and maintains its buildings and residential accommodation, provides its maintenance, housekeeping and catering, currently provides a Principal for the College from its number free of charge, and, effectively, underwrites its finances. The Chair of the Trustees is the Superior of the Community. In addition, the Trustees have set up a College Council, chaired by a diocesan Bishop, with 20 members currently (including three Trustees) to take responsibility for the governance of the College. These arrangements are set out in a 2011 Governance Manual which defines the functions of the Trustees, the Council and various Council committees (Staffing, Nominations, Formation, Finance & General Purposes), and sets out the duties of the College Principal and its academic and administrative staff. Both the Trustees and the Council meet termly. In addition, oversight of the College is exercised routinely by the Chair of the Trustees directly with the College Principal. The Principal, the Director of Pastoral Studies, the

College Bursar and the Community's site manager form the Management Team for the College, supported by the Principal's PA. The Principal is the key appointment. The latest version of his job description describes it in the following terms:

"The fundamental task of the Principal is to work sympathetically with the ethos of a monastic foundation in promoting a theological community, with a special care for the formation of those preparing for ordained ministry."

- 94. These arrangements, although complicated and with some potential for duplication between the Trustees and the Council, appear functional and to operate generally as envisaged in the Governance Manual. They depend heavily on good working relations between College and Community administrative staff, but the Trustees judge that they bring expertise to the governance of the College from which both the College and the Trustees benefit. It was clear to us that they also have other benefits for the College. It is absolved by them from the employment of support service and maintenance staff who are provided, at a charge designed only to recover the cost, on a Mirfield site-wide basis, and its management can thus concentrate on its core functions. It is also, in some measure, protected from financial risks that might arise were it not a part of a larger entity which manages its corporate finances centrally. The Council with its membership of those with a stake in its success and others with expertise in HR, the law, finance, education and business, has the potential to provide the College and the Trustees with valuable heterodox expertise and experience, as long as its members see their role as a key part of the governance of the College not just as representatives of stakeholder institutions. Finally, the close relationship between the College and the Community in general and the Principal and Superior in particular ensures that for the time being the College operates effectively within the wider Mirfield framework and works "with the ethos of a monastic foundation".
- 95. While both the Trustees and the Council (through its Finance & General Purpose Committee) pay close attention to the College's finances, we did not see evidence of either systematically testing performance against agreed objectives and we comment further on this important area in Section M and **Recommendation 7**. Nor did we see evidence of formal induction training nor of refresher training for Council members. In that most of the membership bring particular expertise to the table this may be an omission that need only be addressed through initial briefings (and the provision of

copies of key documents) with an emphasis on the governance role of the Council, with refresher briefings for members from the Chair and/or the College Bursar on a rotating basis. For the two student members of the Council who are appointed for one year terms, however, we judge that something more structured would be appropriate given their likely lack of relevant experience. This might include briefing sessions with the Academic Staff member of Council and the College Bursar, some guidance on charity law and the role of trustees and, as suggested by the student members in March 2016, attendance at a Council meeting as an observer in advance of taking up membership.

96. While best practice for appointments to governance bodies might be thought to require public advertisement, we do not see this as essential for Council appointments here as long as the Nominations Committee seeks determinedly to secure balance on the Council overall, in terms of gender and churchman-ship in particular, and the membership engages actively with its governance role. Both would be made easier if tenure were shortened generally to match practice in government, the professions and business where three plus three year non-executive appointments have become a norm. Further, we judge that the Council would find it easier to discharge its key governance role if it had a smaller membership, and we propose that the nominations Committee should consider that issue with a view to making recommendations to the Council as a whole, and to the Trustees, on its membership. However, this adjustment to membership should ensure that the Council continues to have effective involvement from those who can bring an "external perspective" to decisions and governance.

#### **Recommendation 6**

#### We recommend that the College Council should

- i) introduce initial and refresher training for Council members with a particular emphasis on the needs of its student members; and
- ii) review the membership with the objective of reducing its size.
- 97. Good governance is supported by effective, published, policies that regulate the way an institution operates. The College is well placed here. It has a Staff Handbook, most recently updated in July 2015, which sets out clearly a full range of employment policies and others on health and safety and data protection. We also saw a 2015-16 Student Handbook which provides detailed guidance for the student community on living and studying at

Mirfield. Students told us that they found it a helpful introduction when they joined the College and a source of reference thereafter. While we detected a lack of student appetite for reporting health and safety incidents in the College Safety Book, in summary we conclude that the College has come a long way since the 2011 Inspection in developing, and using, the policies it needs. We noted, however, the absence of any disability access plan and of a disaster recovery plan (though both were in prospect) and comment on these omissions in Sections P and M respectively.

- L.iv. There should be evidence of a structured contribution made by all community members teaching staff, ancillary staff, the student body and individuals so that they play an effective role in decision-making.
- 98. A member of the College academic staff, the Dean of Chapel, is currently the staff representative on the Council, and two students (the appointed "Senior Student" and another chosen by election) each year similarly represent the student body, but we identified no formal mechanisms for capturing in advance either staff or student views on issues being discussed in Council, nor for reporting back on its deliberations. The College will wish to consider how a more inclusive approach might be secured in this regard, not least because an informed experience of corporate governance is likely to benefit many students after ordination when they come to take up trustee responsibilities in parishes. We comment further on this point in Section M and **Recommendation 7**.
- 99. Each year a number of students are given College-wide responsibilities. In addition to the Senior Student, appointed by the Principal after consultations, who chairs meetings of the (student) Common Room and generally represents the student body to the staff, two sacristans are appointed to assist the Dean of Chapel in the liturgical life of the College, and three Convenors support each of the three tutor groups. There are weekly diary meetings between staff and students, and a Staff/Student Committee which meets termly and addresses hygiene factors such as food, equipment and accommodation. While we did not have an opportunity to attend a meeting of this committee, nor of the Liaison Committee (designed to facilitate student cooperation with those on the adjacent Yorkshire Ministry Course), we judge that these arrangements are effective and noted a good deal of student appetite for supporting the corporate life of the College. Evidence for this was shown by students taking on responsibility for hosting visits by those considering training for ordination at Mirfield, by their arranging family events for the spouses and families of

fellow students, and by their active and informed interest in the current Review. We had an opportunity of a discussion with a group of married students and their spouses. From this we conclude that, while being the spouse of an ordinand here, as elsewhere, has its stresses and strains, most had found the College, and the brethren of the Community, welcoming, inclusive and supportive.

- 100. So far as staff engagement in governance is concerned, the team that effectively runs the College, a Principal, three academic staff and four support staff seemed to us to be held together more by mutual respect and affection than by any particular institutional arrangements, but this is, perhaps, to be expected with such a small team.
- L.v. The institution's audited annual reports should be produced in good time and filed with the Charity Commission/Companies House as appropriate.
- 101. We were given the last five annual Report & Accounts for the College and were able to confirm that they had been produced on time and filed appropriately.

The review team has Confidence with qualifications with regard to Criterion L, Organisation and governance.

#### M Business planning and risk management

Reviewers will look at evidence for the existence and implementation of the institution's strategic policies. Subject to considerations of scale, as at section L:

- M.i. There should be a regularly updated long-term strategy document agreed by the trustees and, in line with it, a business plan covering 3-5 years which identifies short and medium term aims and objectives and identifies how the institution intends to meet them.
- *M.ii.* Annual budgets should be prepared in line with the business plan.
- 102. The College's business planning and risk management arrangements flow from its governance structures. Key responsibilities, for example for the College buildings, are held outside the College as part of Mirfield-wide arrangements, and the College's strategic context is detailed, not in a College document, but in an ambitious Mirfield Site Management Plan 2014-2017 which sets out high level objectives and performance indicators

for all the (many) institutions and entities that operate at Mirfield. In addition, Community staff prepared (in 2013) a Business Plan for the Mirfield site as a whole, which also includes references to the College. This plan, however, is principally focussed on the whole site's finances in the context of the 2008-10 recession and recurring operational deficits, and is explicitly designed for internal financial purposes and is, thus, not able to support other governance aspects effectively.

- 103. While these arrangements are a good deal more robust than those found by the Inspectors in 2011, they do not, in our view, provide all the underpinning necessary for effective management and good governance at the College. We were, therefore, pleased to find that the College was, during our Review, in the process of constructing its own more detailed plan to address that need. This College Plan was first shared with the Council in March 2016 and ideas for its regular review discussed. It summarises the aspirations and programme of the College, and draws together aims, objectives and supporting information from the Mirfield site-wide documents, Trustee discussions and the deliberations of the Council and of management. It aims to facilitate planning, and assist both day to day management and also the Council and staff in the fulfilling of their responsibilities. It provides a level of detail that is not available in the sitewide Management and Business Plans, and this should allow a greater degree of visibility and engagement than hitherto for those who work and study at the College and will be affected by it.
- 104. Integration of this new College Plan with the College's existing management and governance arrangements will be important. There are, in our view, two key priorities here. The first is to ensure that the Council gives sufficient time and attention each year to reviewing the Plan and to receiving and considering reports from management on progress against the objectives listed, using performance indicators as appropriate. We see this as the Council's most important responsibility. The Trustees may similarly wish to review progress against the Plan.
- 105. The second concerns the engagement of staff and students in these processes. We noted in Section L (para 98) the lack of any systematic staff and student involvement in the Council's work and conclude that the introduction of this Plan provides a good opportunity to put that right. The March 2016 Council meeting, at which the student representatives sought permission to circulate agendas and minutes among the student body,

demonstrated their appetite for greater visibility. This received a positive response, but we judge that it would be worth the College exploring whether an even richer student engagement could be provided. Accordingly:

# **Recommendation 7**

We recommend that the College and the College Council give a high priority to the integration of the new College Plan with the College's existing student, management and governance arrangements, by

- i) enabling the Council's effective ownership, oversight and review of the College Plan; and
- ii) providing mechanisms for the full engagement of staff and students with Council business including the College Plan.
- M.iii. There should be an effective risk assessment, review and management process, which should include physical, financial, business and reputational risks.
- 106. A risk register has been prepared for the whole Mirfield site as part of the Site Management Plan. It includes many risks that bear on the College and also the main risks to which only the College could be exposed. These concern financial viability arising from falls in student numbers, and the risk of a disaster impacting on the College, its buildings, systems or people. Actions to mitigate these risks, so far as they fall to the College to address, are included in the objectives listed in the new College Plan, and we do not judge that a separate College only risk register is, therefore, necessary. We do, however, consider that the College should press on with the preparation of a Disaster Recovery Plan of its own setting out how an accident or incident affecting the College would be managed, seeking professional advice in its preparation where necessary. We were told that it was envisaged that one would be completed this year. Such a plan might, perhaps, set out the frequency of fire, electricity, security and HSE inspections and detail responsibilities in the event of an incident; propose where students would go if accommodation was damaged and what would be done if staff or students' papers were destroyed; and explain what insurance cover was available. On this last point, we note that the Community has in place insurance cover across the site to provide operating capital for two years while any building reconstruction is carried out, but doubt whether that would be sufficient time to plan for, design and construct replacement buildings if there was, for example, a major fire.

# **Recommendation 8**

We recommend that the College presses on with the preparation of a Disaster Recovery Plan, obtaining such professional advice on its contents as it needs.

The review team has Confidence with qualifications with regard to Criterion M, Business planning and risk management.

### N Financial policies

Reviewers will consider the effectiveness of day-to-day operating processes:

- N.i. The institution should have policies to control and manage investments, expenditure and borrowing, and the annual report and accounts should contain an appropriate reserves policy.
- *N.ii* Management accounts showing performance against budget should be produced at least quarterly and reviewed regularly by the trustees.
- N.iii. The institution should consider its sources of income and have strategies to identify and raise the funds it needs.
- N.iv The institution should have adequate financial controls aimed at minimising waste and loss, and should be appropriately advised on tax-efficiency.
- 107. Since governance changes in 2004, the College has had virtually no long term investments of its own (apart from one modest hardship fund), its former holdings (in the Frere Fund) having then been transferred to the Community. Interest/income on the Frere Fund is paid to the College quarterly, and the Community occasionally provides further funds when the College is in need of support. In this situation, the College has no need of external borrowings, but it does have a reserve built up over the years from small operating surpluses invested with Brewin Dolphin. Its policy is to maintain sufficient working capital, but not to build up substantial reserves, and this seems appropriate given that the Community effectively underwrites its finances.
- 108. Management accounts are prepared quarterly and are reviewed by management and by the Council Finance & General Purposes Committee

and the Trustees. They show actuals against budget provision under all the main headings of income and expenditure, and provide a clear account of financial progress through the year. We suggest that all groups of readers might, however, find it helpful each quarter to have additionally a forecast of the likely annual outturn under each heading to set against the annual budget figures. That would focus attention, when there have been significant over- or under-spends, on the likely end year position early enough to make possible timely adjustments to plans.

- 109. All trading activities and most fundraising at Mirfield are undertaken by the Community so as to support all the activities on the site. The College, accordingly, is not involved in trading or other activities to raise funds on its own account outside its core charitable role of ordination and other training. We were pleased to note, however, that Community staff had set up a trading company for its non-charitable trading activities, such as bed & breakfast accommodation and weddings, thereby complying with Charity Commission and HMRC guidance.
- 110. The College has sound financial controls in place. Budgets are prepared when student numbers are known, are discussed by management and approved by the Finance & General Purposes Committee and by the Trustees. Overspends on any budget line have to be agreed in advance and are then reported quarterly. All payments made both online and offline have to be authorised by two signatures, normally the Bursar plus either the Principal or the Dean of Chapel. All expenses by the students have to be approved in advance by an academic member of staff, and any expenses incurred by those staff are similarly authorised by the Principal. Given these controls and the predictable nature of much of the College's income and expenditure we judge that the College is at low risk of fraud, loss or waste. None has been reported to the auditors in the last ten years.

The review team has Confidence with regard to Criterion N, Financial policies.

# O Statutory and operating policies

- O.i. Proper books of accounts should be kept, with computerised data regularly backed up and stored offsite.
- O.ii. Bank mandates should be up to date, with appropriate authority levels.
- 111. The College's accounts are all managed electronically using Sage software, including Sage Cloud for payroll. Data is backed up appropriately overnight both on and off site. No loss of data has occurred since the current arrangements were introduced more than fifteen years ago. Bank mandates were up to date at the time of the review with appropriate authority levels as indicated in Section P.

The review team has Confidence with regard to Criterion O, Statutory and operating policies.

# P Accommodation

- P.i. The public, teaching and provided private living accommodation should be fit for purpose and suited to students' needs, with an ongoing maintenance programme and forward planning for future needs.
- 112. We had an opportunity to view some student rooms and family housing, and all the College's public and teaching facilities. All appeared to provide accommodation appropriate to the needs of staff and students, and, generally, to be in a good state of repair and decoration. Students to whom we spoke expressed themselves happy with their en suite bedrooms and/or study rooms. Some public spaces, notably the College's (lower church) chapel and the refectory, provided particularly effective and attractive locations for key aspects of the College's corporate life. We did, however, hear a mixture of views about the quality of property maintenance of the College facilities, and some stories about delays in the provision of necessary equipment and in securing support from the sitewide teams, whose priorities were said to be weighted heavily towards the monastic buildings. We were not able to determine whether such a pecking order did in fact exist or whether claimed delays at the College reflected no more than the need for economies across the site as a whole following the 2008-10 recession. What was clear was that securing the services the College needed from the site-wide teams sometimes required a good deal of senior administrative engagement on both sides. Against

that background we endorse the intention reflected in the new College Plan to seek to put in place service level agreements covering the provision to the College of centrally provided services.

- *P.ii.* There should be adequate provision for the needs of disabled students.
- According to the Equality Act 2010, it is against the law for a school or 113. other education provider to treat disabled students unfavourably. Further, an education provider has a duty to make 'reasonable adjustments' to make sure disabled students are not discriminated against, for example by making changes to physical features to allow access to a building or employing extra assistance for those who are disabled. As an educational charity these provisions must apply to the College, and, in a difficult site for those lacking mobility, it has gone some way to address the requirements, for example through the provision of lifts and sloping paths, and has benefited from guidance provided by the Diocesan Disability Officer. It is doubtful, however, that a student in a wheelchair would be able to access all the facilities, with changes in levels and steep and long gravel paths likely to present particular problems. Whether or not it would be reasonable to expect the College to make further adjustments is a matter of judgment and must, for example, depend on the practicality and cost of any further changes. That said, we commend the College for planning a review of its disability provision and for the intention to follow that review up with the drafting of a full Disability Access Plan. That should place the College in a stronger position going forward. Such a Plan might set out how it addresses the needs of potential students with various disabilities, what "reasonable" changes it has already made, and, if that were the case, why other changes were not considered practical.

The review team has Confidence with regard to Criterion P, Accommodation.

# CONCLUSION

Overall outcome: The review team has Confidence in the College of the Resurrection, Mirfield for preparing candidates for ordained ministry.

# LIST OF RECOMMENDATIONS

# **Recommendation 1**

We recommend that the College seeks to develop a greater partnership with the Yorkshire Ministry Course, especially in regard to sharing staff resources, with the aim of forming a secure framework for collaboration.

# **Recommendation 2**

We recommend that the College Council pays particular attention to, and supports the staff in handling, these difficult matters of diversity.

### **Recommendation 3**

We recommend that additional provision is made for equipping ordinands with regard to mission, worship and preaching for contexts "outside" the church, where people have limited knowledge and contact with the church and the Christian Faith.

### **Recommendation 4**

We recommend that the College explores with former students, when seeking feedback as envisaged in the College Plan (objective 3), information about their experiences of transition from the Mirfield pattern to their parochial situation, and to consider whether further help is needed with transition, for example in the final term Leaver's course or in some other way.

#### **Recommendation 5**

We recommend that the College reviews the requirement for all ordinands to attend the early morning eucharist on Sundays on every occasion, so as to facilitate the opportunity for greater engagement and learning when in placement parishes ion Sunday mornings.

#### **Recommendation 6**

We recommend that the College Council should

- i) introduce initial and refresher training for Council members with a particular emphasis on the needs of its student members; and
- ii) review the membership with the objective of reducing its size.

# **Recommendation 7**

We recommend that the College and the College Council give a high priority to the integration of the new College Plan with the College's existing student, management and governance arrangements, by

- i) enabling the Council's effective ownership, oversight and review of the College Plan; and
- ii) providing mechanisms for the full engagement of staff and students with Council business including the College Plan.

# **Recommendation 8**

We recommend that the College presses on with the preparation of a Disaster Recovery Plan, obtaining such professional advice as to contents as it needs.